The Influence of the Visual Arts on the Landscape Photographs of William James Topley

by

Sharon Mary Newton

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts in

Art History

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario

© 2020 Sharon Mary Newton
Abstract

My thesis proposes a new way of understanding one of the most prominent Canadian photographers of the nineteenth and early twentieth century: it considers William James Topley as an aspiring photographic artist. Previous literature has studied him as a commercial photographer and businessman; however, my argument moves away from that characterization and discusses his various connections and interests in the visual arts. The case study looks at photographic reproduction of artworks from Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings), including Lucius O'Brien's, Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880). Furthermore, it compares them to selected photographs from Paysages canadiens, Topley II. The comparison brings to light Topley's connection to the arts and artists the Royal Canadian Academy of Art and The National Gallery of Canada. I argue that Topley used these reproductions of landscape paintings as references for his landscape photographs of the Cape Trinity on the Saguenay River.
Acknowledgements

There are many who travelled with me on this journey and to whom I am indebted. All have given me the guidance and support I needed in various ways through a very difficult few years in my life. To my family, (Paul, Miranda, Connor, and Nathan), it has not always been easy while Mom has been working on this these last few years. You all took deserve a metal for putting up with me, particularly during these last few months. Nevertheless, you let me be and I got ‘er done! Love you.

To my advisors Dr. Carol Payne and Dr. Brian Foss without their patience, understanding, and insights I would not have finished this project. Carol, you understood and went to bat for me every time I needed you to without question or complaint. Your knowledge, guidance, and friendship will always be greatly appreciated. Thank you. To Brian you gave me insights and guidance on post-Confederation Canadian art and artists that was invaluable and encouraged me to look beyond and outside of the box. Your comments had me chuckling at times and cheered me up during the last edits of this project. Thank you.

To curator and friend, Christopher Davidson of the National Gallery of Canada, who was always there to help me find something in the archives or to suggest a different way of thinking. Thank you. To the archivists and librarians at Library and Archives Canada, who are amazing, and never seemed to tire of my constant questions. There are too many to name but you all are the best.

My thesis is dedicated to my friend and mentor, Dr. Marc Andrew Hewson (10/10/1970-31/12/2018). The first professor who I was blessed enough to take an English class with when I first arrived at Carleton as a mature undergraduate, all those
years ago. He saw in me what I could not at the time, the heart of a scholar and a love of learning. He encouraged me, put up with my constant questions, and showed me that I had the ability to do this academic thing or the dark side, as we would come to call it. Without his wicked sense of humor, numerous coffee rendezvous’ and ear to listen, despite discipline, I would never have gotten as far as I have. I wish you here ‘Ole wise one - to read this last paper, it is finally my best.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................. ii

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................. iii

Table of Contents ..................................................................................................... v

List of Illustrations ................................................................................................... vi

Introduction ............................................................................................................... 1

Chapter 1 William James Topley’s Development Towards the Photographic Arts .................................................................................................................. 15

1.1 Topley and the Emergence of Camera Clubs: The Camera Club of Ottawa and The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa ...................................................... 17

1.2 The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa ................................................................ 18

1.3 Changes in the Perception of Photography .......................................................... 22

1.4 The Studio Album: Photographic Reproduction of Paintings in Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings) .................................................................................. 27

1.5 The Stamp of Modernity and the Adaptation of Fine Arts Traditions ................. 32

1.6 William James Topley and his Connections to the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts, and the National Gallery of Canada .................................................. 34

Chapter 2 Images of the Saguenay Region: William James Topley’s Saguenay Landscapes .................................................................................................... 41

2.1 Paysages canadiens: Landscape Photographs or Commercial Images? ............... 42

2.2 The Saguenay: Scenic Tourism and the Romance of the Excursion ................. 47
2.3 Royalty, Writers, Artists:
The Popularity of the “Great River of Canada” ...........................................51

2.4 The Narrative of Lucius O’Brien’s “Great River of Canada”:
Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880) .............................................52

2.5 Advancements in Photographic Technology..............................................56

2.6 Paysages canadiens, Topley II: The Images of Cape Trinity..................58

2.7 In Trinity Bay, Saguenay and
Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880) ..........................................63

Conclusion......................................................................................................68

Illustrations....................................................................................................72

Bibliography...................................................................................................99
List of Illustrations

Figure Intro. 1 William James Topley, *Trinity on the Saguenay, P.Q.* (n.d.), Saguenay River (Que) glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, accession number 1936-270, Credit: William James Topley/Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3320860

Figure Intro. 2 William James Topley, *Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Album cover, covered in burgundy coloured leather with embossed gold on the spine, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON Topley Studio Fonds, Box # 01985

Figure Intro. 3 William James Topley, Topley Studio Album, *Album 29, (Ottawa & Paintings)*, black leather covered album with gold lettering on the spine, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box # 01972

Figure 1.1 Topley Studio Advertisement, Publicity, Credit: Topley Studio/ Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3406446

Figure 1.2 *The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa*, first page of the Constitution and Bylaws, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Reference #R3411-0-2-E

Figure 1.3 *The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa*, first entry in the minute book of the blub dated 1898, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON/Reference #R3411-0-2-E

Figure 1.4 *The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa*, Page from the minute book, dated 1898, signatures of the original members, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Reference #R3411-0-2-E

Figure 1.5 William James Topley, *Mount Robson and Berg Lake B.C.* (1913) b & w, nitrate negative, film; 12.5 x 17.5 cm. Credit: William James Topley, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3307643

Figure1.6 *The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa*, minute book, describing the role of honorary members (1898) (detail), Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Reference #R3411-0-2-E

Figure 1.7 William James Topley, *Laurier Avenue Bridge, Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)*, Page 4, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, (n.d) Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN 138219

Figure 1.8 William James Topley, *Christ Church Cathedral, Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)* Page 5, b x w, albumen print, (n.d.) Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN 138219
Figure 1.9 William James Topley, *Log Driving the Gatineau River P.Q. Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)*, Page 9, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, (n.d), Credit: Sharon Newton/ Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN 138219

Figure 1.10 *Royal Canadian Academy of Arts*, Exhibition Catalogue, 1880 RCA/NGC/ National Gallery of Canada EX001/ Special Collections. Ottawa ON.

Figure 1.11 Homer Watson/ *The Hillside Gorge* (1898), *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)* Page 21, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of artwork by William James Topley, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972

Figure 1.12 Paul Peel, *Mother Love* (1888), *Album 29 (Ottawa and Paintings)* Page 18, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of artwork by William James Topley, Credit: Sharon Newton/Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972

Figure 1.13 G. A. Reid, *Mortgaging the Homestead* (1889), *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)* Page 95, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of artwork by William James Topley, Credit: Sharon Newton/ Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972

Figure 1.14 Lucius R. O’Brien, *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880), *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)* Page 97 b x w, albumen, print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of artwork by William James Topley, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972

Figure 1.15 *Royal Canadian Academy of Arts, Committee*, Tenth Annual Exhibition, March 12, 1889, Photograph, includes: standing (l. to r.) Andrew Thomas Taylor, Frederick Marlett Bell-Smith, John William Hurrell Watts, Robert Harris, Forshaw Day, John Wycliffe Lowes Forster, Hamilton MacCarthy, John Colin Forbes. Seated (l. to r.) William Brymner, Otto Reinhold Jacobi, L.R. O’Brien, Alexander Cowper Hutchison, James Smith. Credit: William James Topley, National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa ON, EX003/ Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON (PA 42348)

Figure 1.16 William James Topley, *Princess Louise’s Studio at Rideau Hall, April 1880, Ottawa (Ont.) Princess Louise Album*, albumen print, positive silver paper, 183 x 235 mm, Credit: William James Topley, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3210914

Figure 1.17 William James Topley, *Princess Louise’s Boudoir with the painted door, named also the Blue Drawing Room at Rideau, Princess Louise Album*, b x w, Albumen print, 183 x 235 mm, April 1880, Ottawa (Ont.) Credit: William James Topley, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3210912
Figure 1.18 Honorary Members of the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts
Exhibition Catalogue for Seventh Annual Exhibition, Date: 1886, includes the name of
William James Topley, National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa ON, Ex 0002

Figure 1.19 William James Topley, Peleg Franklin Brownell (1857-1946) Artist, 1912,
18 x 12.5 cm, Credit: Sharon Newton, Collection of the Camera Club of Ottawa Fonds
from the 1970 Retrospective of the Club, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON,
Topley Studio Fonds/Mikan no. 3191886

Figure 1.20 Peleg Franklin Brownell, The Photographer, (1886) Oil on canvas, 61.2 x
51.2 cm. diploma work, National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa ON,
https://www.gallery.ca/salon-hanging

Figure 1.21 William James Topley, Self Portrait, (n.d.), 18 x 12.5 cm, Collection of the
Camera Club of Ottawa Fonds from the 1970 Retrospective of the Club, Credit: Sharon
Newton, Library and Archives Canada. Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN
no.3425967

Figure 1.22 Peleg Franklin Brownell, Lamplight (1893), Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)
Page 16, reproduction of an artwork by William James Topley, Credit: Sharon Newton,
Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972

Figure 1.23 Peleg Franklin Brownell, Baptism on the Gatineau River P.Q. (1910) Oil on
canvas, 38.6 x 46.3, Edwards Family Fonds, Topley Studio Fonds, Library and Archives
Canada, Ottawa ON, a043064, MIKAN no. 3929133

Figure 2.1 William James Topley, Cape Trinity on the Saguenay River, (ca. 1880)
Paysages canadiens, Topley II, Album 83, Page 30, Saguenay (Que), b & w Glass
Plate Negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm. accession number 1936-270 Credit: Topley Studio,
Topley Series SE (639-148-4-E) Library and Archives Canada. Ottawa ON, Topley
Studio Fonds, Box #01985

Figure 2.2 William James Topley, In Trinity Bay, Paysages canadiens, Topley II, Album
83, Page 5, b & w, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm. Saguenay
(que), accession number 1936-270, Credit: Topley Studio, Topley Series SE (R639-
148-4-E), Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa On, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985,
MIAKN no. 330862

Figure 2.3 William James Topley, Untitled, Paysages canadiens, Topley II, Album 83,
Page 3, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photo of a fishing basket, reel and fish,
accession number 1936-270 Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada,
Ottawa, ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985

Figure 2.4 William James Topley, Sailing on the Saguenay, Paysages canadiens,
Topley II, Album 83, Page 4, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, accession number
1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Topley
Studio Fonds, Box #01985
Figure 2.5 William James Topley, *Cabin at Bardsville, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 1, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985

Figure 2.6 Topley Studios, Logbook of glass-plate negatives, Topley Studios, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Topley Studio Fonds, FDA 0206

Figure 2.7 William James Topley, *Base of Cape Trinity, Tadousac and the Saguenay*, Album 159, Page 35, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box # 01987

Figure 2.8 William James Topley, *Tadousac and the Saguenay*, Album 159, Album cover, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box # 01987

Figure 2.9 William James Topley, *St. Marguerite*, Album 160, 40 x 30 cm, green leather cover with gold embossed lettering, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box # 01988

Figure 2.10 William James Topley, *Lake Lorne, P.Q. Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 82, Page unknown, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985

Figure 2.11 Lucius R. O'Brien, *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880)
Oil on canvas, 90 x 127 cm, Credit Christopher Davidson, with permission, National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa, ON.

Figure 2.12 Albert Bierstadt, *Looking Down Yosemite Valley, California* (1865),
Oil on Canvas, 96 1/2” x 64” Birmingham Museum of Art, Provided by Arts and Culture Google

Figure 2.13 William James Topley, *Mr. Bierstadt*, between February 24-26th 1876 in Ottawa (Ont.), glass plate negative, b x w, 16.5 x 11.3 cm. accession number 1936-270, Credit: William James Topley, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, e011091588, MIKAN No. 3477245

Figure 2.14 William James Topley, *Mrs. Bierstadt*, between February 24-26th 1876 in Ottawa (Ont.), glass plate negative, b x w, 16.5 x 11.3 cm, accession number 1936-270, Credit: William James Topley, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, e011091590, MIKAN No. 3477247
Figure 2.15 William James Topley, *Lord Dufferin’s Fancy Dress Ball, Government House, Ottawa, Canada, on February 23, 1876, Ottawa (Ont.)* composite photograph, silver salts on silver, 83.4 x 34.7 cm (image) accession number 1966-094 NPC Credit: Topley Studio, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Robert H. Fooks Collection, e010900211

Figure 2.16 American Optical Venus Box Camera, 1879-1910, The California Museum of Photography, University of California.

Figure 2.17 William James Topley, *Base of Trinity, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II Page 34, Album 83, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, a008786

Figure 2.18 William James Topley, *Saguenay River, P Q. (between 1878-1883)* Saguenay River, (Que), *Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 31, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm. accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN no: 3320861

Figure 2.19 William James Topley, *Trinity, Saguenay River (Que), Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 32, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON., Topley Studio Fonds, a008786

Figure 2.20 William James Topley, *Trinity, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Saguenay River (Que), Page 33, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, a008786

Figure 2.21 William James Topley, *In Trinity Bay, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II Saguenay, Page 35, Album 83, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm. accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN no. 3244823

Figure 2.22 William James Topley, *In Eternity Bay, Saguenay*, Image 65 of the *Princess Louise Album*, also in *Paysages Canadian* Topley II, Page 35, Album 83, Titled: In Trinity Bay) Saguenay (Que) glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm. accession number 1936-270, Credit: Sharon Newton, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN no. 3244823
Introduction

In photography, it can not be said or denied that our people challenge the most able competition. I have, to be sure, heard complaints with reference to the manner with which, by means of photographs, Canadians are depicted to the outside world. I have heard it stated that one of the many causes of the gross ignorance which prevails abroad with reference to our beautiful climate, is owing to the persistence with which our photographers love to represent chiefly our winter scenes.¹

Sir John Douglas Sutherland Campbell, The Marquis of Lorne, from his speech at the Opening of the Montreal Art Association Exhibit, May 27th, 1879

Between 1878 and 1882,² Ottawa-based photographer William James Topley travelled to the Saguenay region of Quebec and captured many images of the landscape. One of the photographs, *Trinity on the Saguenay, P.Q.*, [Figure. Intro. 1], shows the massive rock promontory of Trinity on the Saguenay River. The image depicts the geographical environment, showing the beach, the various foliage, and the massive bluff across the bay in the distance. The result was that this image and many others were used in various of Topley’s collections and albums, including a three-volume set of albums entitled *Paysages Canadiens* [sic; *canadiens*] [Figure. Intro. 1] (1878-1882). In another Topley album, entitled *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)* (circa 1895-1905) [Figure. Intro. 2], there are photographic reproductions of paintings by Canadian artists, half of which are landscapes. These four albums show the diversity of work produced by W. J. Topley. Currently, few would associate Topley with landscape photography and the visual arts in Canada. Instead, he is well known for his commercial

---

² Topley returned to the Saguenay in 1910, according to the dates that Library and Archives Canada attributed to some photographs of the region.
portrait studio business\textsuperscript{3} and his photographs of royalty, government officials, the social elite, immigrants, and middle-class Canadians during the late nineteenth and early twentieth century; this leaves his landscape photography largely ignored. Nevertheless, landscape photographs make up a substantial amount of his oeuvre.

The central theme of my thesis demonstrates that William James Topley had an abiding interest in the arts and was particularly interested in landscape photography. I argue that Topley's involvement and interactions with many Canadian artists and institutions of his contemporary cultural moment influenced his landscape images, which led to the development of his artistic sensibility. A selection of images from \textit{Paysages canadiens}, \textit{Topley II}\textsuperscript{4} will illustrate his adoption of visual art practices in his depictions of Cape Trinity through a comparison to Lucius O'Brien's\textsuperscript{5} diploma piece, \textit{Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity} (1880).

The Topley landscapes in \textit{Paysages canadiens} at first seem to be merely accurate recordings of the topology and vistas of the region; however, there is more transpiring in the images. Capturing both the moment and the majestic beauty of the area is not the main purpose of the composition. The photographer is making aesthetic choices about what to include in the picture. Thus, the question arises: what did the photographer leave out? Topley considered his spectators' expectations of landscape imagery and composed his photographs to evoke emotional responses. As Joel Snyder notes, "Changes in the technical practice of photography resulted in photographic prints


\textsuperscript{4} The albums of \textit{Paysages canadiens} are titled \textit{Topley I}, \textit{Topley II}, and \textit{Topley III}. I will use these descriptors instead of the album or volume numbers which were designated by Library and Archives Canada.

\textsuperscript{5} Lucius R. O'Brien (1832-1899) was a surveyor for 40 years and retired to take up the gentlemanly pursuit of painting. He was also the first president of the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts.
that looked machine-made because of their high finish and endless detail, and consequently were thought to be precise, accurate, and faithful to the objects or scenes they represented.\textsuperscript{6} The public perception of the photograph as a faithful transcription was prevalent; yet, at the time, many photographers wanted to change this notion of the photographic image.

**Biographical Information**

William James Topley developed an interest in the visual arts at a young age. He was born in Montreal, Canada East (present-day Quebec) in 1845 to John Topley, a saddler and harness maker, and Anna Delia Harrison. While still a young child, Topley and his family moved from Montreal to Aylmer, Canada East—just 15 kilometres from Ottawa. According to archivist Andrew Rodger, Topley was introduced to photography by his mother, who—while on a trip to Montreal—purchased photographic equipment from the studio of William Notman. This meeting between Anna Topley and Notman would later become advantageous to the young photographer; by 1863, Topley was working in the photographer’s studio as a tintypist.\textsuperscript{7} Noting the young man’s propensity for the medium and aptitude as a business manager, Notman sent Topley to Ottawa in 1868 to open and manage his first studio in the city; however, by 1875, Topley had severed his business relationship with Notman and in 1878 opened the first of his three photographic studios under his own name. In 1888,\textsuperscript{8} Topley opened the last of his three

---


\textsuperscript{7} Richard Benson, *The Printed Picture* (New York: Museum of Modern Art, 2008), 330. Tintype refers to an auto positive photographic print on a piece of blackened iron—in effect, a less expensive version of the ambrotype.

\textsuperscript{8} Shannon Perry, “The Eastman Kodak Co. and the Canadian Kodak Co. Ltd: Re-structuring the Canadian photographic industry, c. 1885-1910” (PhD diss., De Montfort University, 2016), 275
studio locations at 132 Sparks Street in Ottawa’s city core. Topley Studios was widely known for its portraiture (some in the form of *cartes-de-visite*, cabinet cards or composite images) as well as travel guides.

W. J. Topley remained the proprietor of the Sparks Street studio until his retirement in 1907, when his son William De Courcy Topley took over the business. According to Rodger, Topley stayed active in the studio’s affairs until approximately 1918. The studio had been in financial decline for quite some time, and the doors closed for the final time in September of 1923. Topley passed away at the home of his daughter, Helena Sarah Lett, in Vancouver in 1930 but was fittingly laid to rest in Ottawa after having spent so many years of his life capturing the people and the various vistas of the nation’s capital.

Textual Material on W. J. Topley

Unfortunately, there is a limited amount of textual archival material on Topley. Much of the information in the Topley Studios fonds is related to the business and includes assignment logs, a few account books, and other related textual materials. Personal information on Topley comes from accounts of others, through his associations with his clientele and his philanthropic enterprises. He was a civic-minded man of great faith. A life-long Methodist and community leader, he sang in various

---

9 Topley’s studios were located at Bank and Metcalfe, 104 Sparks Street, and 132 Sparks Street in Ottawa. The Wellington location was owned by William Notman of Montreal, and first managed by Topley.
10 Topley’s brothers Horatio and John both apprenticed and worked for the studio, and became photographers in their own right. In 1877, Horatio joined the Department of the Interior, as a photographer and traveled extensively for the department. John stayed with the Topley Studios until 1908, when he left to set up his own studio. Canadian Dictionary of Biography, Topley William James. http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/topley_william_james_15E.html
11 The logbooks and ledgers are quite frail inside the original containers, and LAC has made photocopies of the logs.
choirs and served on several boards such as those of the YMCA, the Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, and the Carleton County Gaol, where he notably made compassionate portraits of Polly, an inmate in the institution. His philanthropic activities give perspective on both the person and photographer, as well as his ambitions in life.

Topley’s approach to photography was informed by contemporary art and civic responsibility. He saw the need for photographers and artists alike to instruct, teach, and collaborate. The photographer served on many culturally-oriented committees—including the Fine Arts Association of Ottawa—and, in 1898, Topley was a founding member of the Camera Club of Ottawa (CCO) and the Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa (PAC) in 1904. The PAC’s primary goal was to present photography as an art form in order to change the general public’s perception of the practice.

Topley published a few articles on photographic techniques that provide insights into his artistic philosophy and business practices. His first major journal article, “Posing,” appeared in an 1881 issue of Photographic Mosaics. In his essay, Topley talks openly about his interaction with sitters and advises professional and amateur photographers alike. Between 1889 and 1893, Topley published four articles in The International Annual of Anthony’s Photographic Bulletin and The American Process Yearbook. These essays discuss portraiture and copyright issues. Topley argues that

---

13 Shannon Percy, “The Eastman Kodak Co. and the Canadian Kodak Co. Ltd: Re-structuring the Canadian photographic industry, c. 1885-1910” (PhD diss., De Montfort University, 2016), 288.
14 William James Topley “Letter to the Editor” Anthony’s Photographic Bulletin, 1898, Hathi Trust. https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt/search?q1=Topley;id=uiuo.ark%3A%2F13960%2Ft25b1fd6c;view=1up;seq=9;start=1;sz=10;page=search;orient=0
photographers warranted the same acclaim as other artists—a concern that resonates to this day.

After William James Topley’s death, William De Courcy Topley sold the complete collection from the studio to Library and Archives Canada (LAC). The Topley Studios fonds contains 150,000 glass plate negatives, film negatives, sixty-eight counter books, some of the studio photo albums, and textual information in the form of accounts and logs. There are no personal journals or diaries in the collection. While there is very little personal information on Topley, the fonds does offer a substantial collection of images that illustrate the operating practices and the development of photographic business at the turn of the century.

Scholarly Literature on William James Topley

The earliest scholarship on Topley was produced by retired LAC archivists Ralph Greenhill and Andrew Birrell, who brought Topley's work to the attention of a broader public. Greenhill’s *Early Photography in Canada* and *Canadian Photography: 1839-1920*, which he co-authored with Birrell, both include mention of Topley and his studio work. In addition, former LAC archivist Andrew Rodger published an article on Topley and his brothers, Horatio and John, entitled “The Topley Family and Photography” for the journal *The Archivist* in 1986. Rodger also wrote the entry on Topley for the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*. Rodger’s most extensive contribution to the literature on Topley, however, is LAC’s online exhibition, *William James Topley: Reflections on a

---

17 Next to William Notman's fonds, the Topley Studios fonds is the second largest in Canada.
Capital Photographer.\textsuperscript{19} The online exhibition provides a summary that touches on most aspects of his career and features an array of photographs, including portraits, composite photographs, and images of immigrants, among others.\textsuperscript{20}

Recent scholarship on Topley has ranged from gender studies to a comprehensive look at his commercial business, focusing on his importance to the Ottawa photographic community. Emma Hamilton-Hobbs' thesis, "From Friendless Women to Fancy Dress Balls: William James Topley’s Photographic Portraits,"\textsuperscript{21} examines how gender roles are depicted in his photographs. Hamilton-Hobbs analyzes Topley's pictures of Victorian women and the visual representations of gender, class, and race in late nineteenth-century Ottawa. Her study focuses on the imagery from Topley's business, which—as one of Ottawa's leading portrait studios—produced thousands of portraits over its history, as well as composite photographs and a series of immigration images commissioned by the Department of the Interior in 1910. Hamilton-Hobbs performs a cultural analysis of gender and class as represented through the images of women—specifically those related to Topley's philanthropic activities outside of his studio. Her work also discusses his interactions with the social elite of Ottawa at the time. Hamilton-Hobbs questions the photographer's representational strategies and power relations in disciplinary spaces, and the concept of moral cleanliness with the images of the female inmates at the Carleton County Gaol. Her thesis culminates with a comparative analysis of the photographic representations of the costumed upper-class

elite and their portraits from Lord Dufferin's Fancy Dress Ball of 1876. As Hamilton-Hobbs argues, the composite photograph designed by Topley Studios illustrates that the gender roles that men and women play on such occasions assume a constructed identity.

Shannon Perry's dissertation, "The Eastman Kodak Co. and the Canadian Kodak Co. Ltd: Re-structuring the Canadian photographic industry, c. 1885-1910," discusses how the Eastman Kodak Company (EKC) changed the photographic industry around the globe. In her final chapter, Perry uses Topley Studios and the Canadian photographic industry as a model for localized photographic communities that had undeveloped or underdeveloped domestic industries before the EKC branched out into these untapped markets. Topley Studios was primarily a portrait-oriented business and included commissions based on older commercial models of the practice; however, W.J. Topley was one of the first in Ottawa to branch out into other areas of the industry and offer for sale various photographic supplies to the Ottawa market, including EKC products such as cameras preloaded with film, and development services. Perry looks at how the EKC was employing modern business practices to make photography into an economically and globally viable industry. As well, Perry examines various business clusters (including Topley and several other photographers in Ottawa) to demonstrate the connections between local and regional industry participants, and distributors and dealers, and to showcase the effects that these clusters had on the industry. The final chapter of her dissertation discusses Topley and John Garrison Palmer, the manager of EKC Ltd, and describes their "professional experiences and interactions with local and
expanded communities of photographic consumers and industry participants”.\textsuperscript{22} Perry addresses the evolution and public understanding of the EKC’s practices during this transitional period. As a result, Perry argues that network restructuring enabled the EKC to shape the wider photographic industry not only in North America but also internationally in the early part of the twentieth century.

While the literature on W.J. Topley himself is limited, scholarship on his contemporaries has been helpful to my research. William Notman (1826-1891) of Montreal, who was the leading photographer at the time, was an early mentor to Topley. Notman was one of the first to franchise and open studios in various cities, both here in Canada and in the United States. Notman’s skill as a photographer was unique in that he used various fine art aesthetics, such as theatrical setups and painted backdrops, that took him beyond his commercial business.\textsuperscript{23} The literature on Notman is extensive due to the curation of a massive number of negatives and prints by the McCord Museum in Montreal, Quebec. Stanley G. Triggs’ \textit{William Notman’s Studio: The Canadian Picture} examines Notman’s photographic practice on Bleury Street in Montreal.\textsuperscript{24} Triggs describes the diversity of the photographer’s work, detailing his studio practice, stereographs, books, and landscapes from across Canada and the United States. Additionally, Triggs explains Notman’s employment practices, which involved hiring and training artists to not only take photographs but also to work on composites in his studio. Working in this environment, Topley would have learned the tools of the photographic trade from a man whose views were similar to his own. Sarah

\textsuperscript{22}Shannon Perry, “The Eastman Kodak Co. and the Canadian Kodak Co. Ltd: Re-structuring the Canadian photographic industry, c. 1885-1910” (PhD diss., De Montfort University, 2016), 2.

\textsuperscript{23} Notman’s Ottawa Studio, which opened in 1868, was located on the corner of Wellington and Metcalfe Streets. Notman sent Topley to manage the location, and Topley bought the business in 1872.

Parsons’ *William Notman: Life & Work* looks at his personal life as part of the Montreal social elite as well as his entrepreneurship. After leaving Scotland in 1856, Notman quickly set up shop and became Montreal’s most prominent photographer. In the article, Parsons brings up the debate on the artistic potential of photography, and states that “Notman boldly advertised himself ‘Photographic Artist.’” These were debates that affected how many photographers saw themselves and, with time, successfully aligned photography with other forms of artistry. In 2016, a retrospective exhibition of his work entitled *Notman: A Visionary Photographer* was organized by the McCord Museum, with a catalogue edited by Hélène Samson and Suzanne Savage. The catalogue discusses many aspects of Notman’s career but focuses on his diversity and innovations as a photographer and artist. Notman’s claim to be a photographic artist is illustrated in various ways, from his conception of the studio space as a space of landscapes.

In the Ottawa community, the photographic industry was quite competitive. The *Ottawa Business Directory* for the year 1898 there was a listing of photographers all within a few blocks of Topley’s Studio. In addition to Topley’s, there were numerous others who were active in the area between 1882 and 1909. Shannon Perry describes that there were many photographers working within two city blocks of Topley’s studio at 132 Sparks Street, and a number on the same street, such as; A. G. Pittaway, S. J. Wilson, G.E Willis, and Samuel Jarvis, who all had studios on Sparks. Perry states: “By

---

28 Shannon Perry, Shannon Perry, “The Eastman Kodak Co. and the Canadian Kodak Co. Ltd: Re-structuring the Canadian photographic industry, c. 1885-1910” 278
1899, here were at least ten establishments involved in the photographic trade located within two city blocks of Topley’s Studio, yet Topley remained the clear leader, and the only one with a storefront clearly dedicated to the sale of photographic materials”. This saturation of the photography business illustrates how influential the culture of the photograph was at the time and highlights the competitive nature of the local market. Yet, despite this competition, there was a camaraderie between the local photographers.

In examining Topley’s connections to the National Gallery of Canada (NGC), the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts (RCA), and Canadian painter Lucius R. O’Brien, I consulted the scholarship of Dennis Reid, a former curator of post-Confederation Canadian art for the NGC. Reid’s “Our Own Country Canada”: Being an Account of the National Aspirations of the Principal Landscape Artists in Montreal and Toronto, 1860-1890, and Lucius R. O’Brien: Visions of Victorian Canada both provided valuable information on the development of the RCA and the NGC, and underscored the importance of Lucius O’Brien’s role as president of the RCA. Reid’s works supplied context and understanding about key artists whose works are included in Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings). As well, his scholarship on O’Brien’s RCA diploma piece Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880) describes the work as one whose narrative proclaims the power and wealth of the new Dominion. In discussing the theories related to Sunrise on the Saguenay, the work of Ellen Ramsay was vital to my understanding of

---

29 The cluster of photographers near Topley’s Studio at 132 Sparks Street, were active between 1882-1909. G. E. Willis active between 1882-1909 was located at 140 Sparks Street, throughout his career. Samuel Jarvis was active between 1882-1923, and was located at 117 Sparks Street, until he moved to a new location at 281 Bank Street for the duration of his career. However, for a short time Jarvis was in partnership with Alfred G. Pittaway, who was active between 1882-1890. He then moved to his own studio at 58 Sparks Street in 1890, but it is unclear how long he is business at this location. http://photographersofontario.ca/index.php?title=Category:Photographer
the painting. Her chapter "Picturing the Picturesque: Lucius O'Brien's Sunrise on the Saguenay," from the volume A Few Acres of Snow: Literary and Artistic Images of Canada, explores various aspects of the painting. Ramsay's analysis gives necessary insight into the geographic location and history of the Saguenay, and probes the aesthetic components, the composition, and the narrative meaning of the work.  

Methodology

Topley's photographs shaped my approach to analyzing his relationship to fine art. Viewing his works has reinforced my certainty that he was deeply committed to photography as an art form. My methodology incorporated inventive ways of seeing and researching while also relying on traditional research methodologies. The basis of my research involved examining historical, literary, and cultural accounts of Victorian social practices, with secondary materials including tourist guidebooks, literary narratives, archives and newspapers. Alongside this historical research, I looked to the guidance of Carol Payne and Andrea Kunard's volume The Cultural Work of Photography in Canada to inform how I examined and understood the meaning of Topley's images. My methodology considered how photography requires the viewer "to decode the syntax of the sequenced images, negotiate text/image relations, and experience the photograph itself as a site of intertextuality." The sequencing of images narrates to the viewer what is culturally understood; however, taken out of context, the viewer has to
discover the meaning of the photograph and any subsequent image, and its cultural value.

Another consideration was the cultural influences that arose as the result of both Canada’s association with Europe and its proximity to the United States. Canadian artists and photographers considered the landscape to be a commodity and depicted it as an object of cultural and economic value. The intersections of culture and the economy give the landscape many roles; it is presented, in turn or simultaneously, as a commodity and as an object to be admired. Adding to this conception of landscape, Brian Osborne states,

The photographer is not the only person concurring in the formation of the document. Attention also needs to be directed to the contexts of the initiation, productions, immediate reception and subsequent reviewing of the images. This encourages the plurality of "ways of seeing" and "ways of looking". That is, any photograph constitutes a dynamic site at which many gazes intersect, and it is this intersection of gazes that transforms the photograph into a kaleidoscopic array of multiple meanings.33

The plurality of gazes adds to the meaning of the image and, in Topley's case, we need to ascertain the intended purpose of his photos. His view of the Saguenay region was informed by his understanding of his contemporary moment, which dictated what he chose to capture and, more importantly, what he did not. Without a doubt, the works were created for commercial purposes, such as for inclusion in tourist guidebooks and studio display albums; however, many of the photographs are based on aesthetics and follow artistic principles involving composition, tonal quality, and subject matter, and consequently were intended as works of art.

Chapter Breakdown

This thesis is divided into two central chapters, both of which delve into the ways that W. J. Topley intertwined his philosophy and business practices with the arts. Chapter One examines Topley's artistic interests during a growth period in Canadian culture. The first section details his involvement with the PAC and its key members. Following this foundational section, the discussion builds with a detailed analysis of Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings). The paintings depicted in the albums are by various Canadian artists who were active during the period in which Canada was developing as a nation and our cultural institutions were being installed. The artworks show the influence of the Picturesque aesthetic on Canadian landscape painters and photographers. The last section discusses the RCA and the NGC, including Topley's involvement with both. His engagement with these organizations occurred largely through his business practice but he also shared a personal friendship with then Governor-General of the Dominion of Canada, Sir John Campbell, Marquis of Lorne.

Chapter Two takes an in-depth look at Paysages canadiens, and I specifically examine five images from Topley II which depict Cape Trinity on the Saguenay River. The chapter also briefly discusses the popularity of the area among the upper-class elites, writers, and artists alike, and the romance associated with the excursion. Finally, the thesis explores Lucius O'Brien's painting Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880) and its importance to the Canadian art scene post-Confederation, which culminates with the aforementioned visual analysis that explicitly looks at Topley's landscape images of Cape Trinity—specifically, Cape Trinity on the Saguenay River, In Trinity Bay, and Trinity on the Saguenay, P.Q. The results of this analysis show the
RCA’s influence on the works of William J. Topley and most primarily by Lucius R. O'Brien.
Chapter 1: William James Topley’s Development in the Photographic Arts

Did I not delight in art, I would not remain in it for 24 hours; and I am more fully convinced than ever, that no person should intrude himself among our fraternity from mercenary motives, not only because his entry is really an intrusion, but because as a business, it does not pay dividends large enough to satisfy such an “artist”.

William James Topley

“On Posing the Sitter,” Photographic Mosaic: An Annual Record of the Photographic Process, 1881

In late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Ottawa, Topley Studios on Sparks Street would likely come to mind if one wanted to have one’s portrait taken. The photographer was highly respected and was well known for portraits of royalty and the social elite but also of more modest clientele. W.J. Topley owned and operated Topley Studios and by 1874, he employed a staff of 14, including photographers, photo-printers, retouchers, and artists. The photographer had a diverse practice who fulfilled commissions for the federal government as well as creating viewbooks and stereographic views, which included many landscapes; yet, despite this output, landscapes are not regarded as an important aspect of his career.

One example of Topley’s work with landscape photography is a three-volume collection of photographs entitled Paysages canadiens [Figure Intro. 1]. A second

---

35 Naomi Rosenblum discusses that between 1839 until the late 1890s a precedent was set with landscape photography as art. The two were accepted by photographers and artists and used as a foundational tool. Rosenblum states: “In the United States, landscape painters—among them Albert Bierstadt, Thomas Cole, and Church—also welcomed the photograph as an ally. It served land-scapists particularly well in their endeavors to represent scientific fact animated by heavenly inspiration—a visual concept reflective of Emerson’s new-world phil.” A History of World Photography, (New York, Aberville Press, 1984), 233.
37 The three albums of Paysages canadiens were assembled and placed in the Canadian Library of Parliament before being preserved at LAC. I was unable to find out how the albums were commissioned.
studio album contextualizes Topley not only as a commercial photographer but as an artisan with an interest in the visual arts. Ottawa & Paintings, also called Album 29 [Figure. Intro. 2], contains photographs of infrastructure, events, and landmark buildings erected in Ottawa; however, mixed throughout the album are twenty photographs of paintings and a sculpture created by various members of the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts (RCA). The images may only be commercial photographs of Canadian art but they indicate that Topley was engaged with all aspects of the visual arts. Quite possibly, these images may have been used as instructive models for Topley’s interest in the art of landscape photography. In short, and as I argue throughout this thesis, Topley may have emulated landscape painting in his photographic images.

This chapter establishes a framework for W. J. Topley as a photographic artist by exploring his involvement in the visual arts in Ottawa. Until recently, scholarship on Topley has focused on his business career while examining his portraiture, immigration photographs, and other commissions. My research diverges from that scholarship by presenting Topley’s interest in photography as an artistic medium.38 The following discussion will look specifically at Topley’s involvement with the Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa (PAC) (1898-1921).39 This work will introduce the debate brought about by the new photographer and the middle-class amateur, and the effect that this movement had on the profession. These arguments lead to my analysis of Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings), and the corresponding influence that the works possibly had on Topley and his landscape photography. Finally, this chapter explores Topley’s connections to artists of the RCA and his commercial work with the NGC. In examining these organizations

---

38 Andrew Rodger, “Topley, William James.”
and Topley’s connections with them, I will present a new view of him as an aspiring photographic artist.

**Topley and the Emergence of Camera Clubs: The Camera Club of Ottawa (1898-Present Day) and the Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa (Cira 1900-1921)**

Between 1898 and 1899, the Camera Club of Ottawa (CCO) was founded by W.J. Topley, William Ide, and Charles Saunders. The club’s mandate was "to study and promote the art of photography in all its branches." The CCO’s membership included all levels of ability, ranging from novice to professional photographers. A history of the club states that the organization was informally founded and gathered prior to 1896. There is no documentation on the official creation; however, the first years indicate that it was quite informal. To mark its seventy-fifth anniversary, the CCO held a retrospective illustrating images from its various exhibitions and showcasing award winners, including the founding members Ide, Saunders, and Topley. One of the earliest entries in the club’s minute book mentions a lecture given by Topley on the development of negatives. The club was quick to promote him as “one of Canada’s

---

42 The differentiation between amateur and novice relates to a variety of skill levels within the medium. The novice was new to the discipline and more concerned with learning how to “operate the camera” for recording one’s personal events and daily life, leaving the other aspects of early photography, such as development of negatives and printing, to the professionals. An amateur, was a designation used for a photographer whose skills were above a novice but was not technically a working professional. Within amateur there two differentiation, casual and serious. Many serious amateurs had the same technical proficiency as a professional photographer; however, many were not interested in the commercial aspect of the business. The casual amateur was more concerned with learning the various requirements of the camera, as the operation, composition, various techniques, as well as photography as an art form, but again left the development and printing to the professionals, such as Topley Studios.
43 Camera Club of Ottawa, 18.
foremost photographers.” His knowledge and expertise were beneficial to the club, and the photographer was amenable to working with individuals of all skill levels. Topley states, “I have the greatest respect for amateurs and help them all I can. I often learn from them for they often rush where ‘angels fear to tread,’ and get there all the same.” Topley’s guidance to amateurs on the various aspects of photography not only encouraged the advancement of the medium but cleverly provided new potential clients for his business. From his Sparks Street studio, Topley was one of the first in Ottawa to sell photographic supplies to the general public. [Figure 1.1] The studio offered a variety of services, such as the development of negatives, selling of chemicals, darkroom rentals, and print development. The nation’s capital was perfect for summer outings and the club would meet often on the Central Experimental Farm or travel to the Gatineau Hills. The Kingsmere Estate near Chelsea, Quebec was a favourite location for the CCO to take pictures.

The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa (1900-1921)

Early in the CCO’s history, eight members left and started a new camera club; it was aptly named the Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa (PAC). Topley was named as

---

44 William J. Topley, William Ide, and Charles Saunders were three of the eight who first left the CCO to start the PAC in 1900.
50 The dates are unclear for both the CCO and the PAC formation, it seems both were organized prior to 1899. Both preferring at first a casual club; however, with the popularity of camera clubs in Canada, the sharing of information between clubs made it beneficial to have a more formal organization.
one of the new organization’s founding members. There is no documentation suggesting that its members continued to contribute to the CCO, and it would seem that Topley and the PAC’s other founders preferred their elite organization made up of photographers with advanced skills; the organization purposely kept their numbers small, and the club’s principal goal was the promotion of photography as an art form. With the PAC’s exclusive environment, the club “had no time for dilettantes.” Although no concrete explanation is given for the PAC’s nascency, the first line of the constitution gives a clue to the club’s motivation, which was “the mutual help in and advancement of the photographic art” [Figure 1.2]. This statement indicates that the group saw photography as an art form and that it was interested in educating the public on this view. The PAC’s first few years were informal—like the CCO’s development—with the first recorded meeting being dated November of 1904. The creation of the constitution occurred in 1908. From the minutes, the secretary confirms that,

The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa, having been in existence for 4 years, without a formal constitution, officers, or formal organizations of any kind, and the desirability of it being properly organized by its members messrs Saunders, Shutt and Ide, were approved a committee to draft a constitution, and to present the same for approval at the clubs first meeting of November 1908 [Figure 1.3].

The first page of the organization’s minute book contains the signatures of the founding participants: Dr. Frank Shutt, Dr. Charles Edward Saunders, John Stanley Plaskett, R.B. Whyte, Jarvis Wilson, Charles McNamara, William Ide, and Topley [Figure 1.4]. Although many of the members were not career photographers in the same arena as Topley (with the notable exception of Jarvis Wilson), many had an advanced skill level.

---

51 Camera Club of Ottawa, “Camera Club of Ottawa, 75 Years of Photography,” 5.
53 Frank Shutt, “Minute Book,” 1908, First meeting of the Photographic Arts Club
John Plaskett was an astronomer with the Dominion Observatory in Ottawa, where photography was part of his professional activities. William Ide was celebrated for his photography and won many medals for his images in various photographic salons in Canada and Europe. The key members’ primary professions may not have been photography; nevertheless, they were clearly not casual amateurs. The members saw the importance of teaching the public to view photographic images artistically. A notation was made by the secretary of the club’s mission to focus on photography as an art form. As club secretary Frank Shutt records,

Mr. Wilson followed with a graphic description of his trip to the Rocky Mountains dealing with the subject from an artistic point of view. He described his sensations in the presence of the mighty peaks and the difficulty he found in getting compositions which would convey some idea of the grandeur and the mystery and the particular charms of the mountain scenery.

Members such as Mr. Wilson wanted to share the experiences and the struggles of capturing the artistic image. In 1914, on a trip to the Rocky Mountains, Topley produced images that replicated “the grandeur and the mystery” called for in the club’s mandate [Figure 1.5]. As a professional photographer, he frequently showed and discussed his images as educational models.

In keeping with the PAC’s mandate of promoting photography as an art form, all new members considered by the club executive had to be unanimously approved. The archival documents mention the inclusion of honorary members, and there is no indication of a number restriction. The constitution states, “Honorary members shall be

56 Frank Shutt, “Minute Book,” 1908, First meeting of the Photographic Arts Club.
57 William James Topley, Mont Robson and Berg Lake B.C. 1914. Topley Studio Fonds, Library and Archives Canada, MIKAN No. 100085.
persons as elected for their interest in photographic art” [Figure 1.6]. Attendance records indicate that honorary associates were kept to a minimum—much like the executive. All club members were encouraged to develop and explore new techniques during a time when photography was evolving rapidly but, despite the rapid advancement of camera technology, many clubs relied on traditional art models to connect photography to art for the viewing public.

The constitution and design of the Ottawa-based club followed the models of many camera clubs. During assemblies, lectures were given by members or invited guests on various topics, critique sessions were held by their peers, social outings were proposed or undertaken, and group exhibitions were planned and implemented. Many of the monthly meetings took place at Topley’s Sparks Street studio but, more often than not, the meetings rotated between the various homes of the executive. These smaller venues encouraged a commitment to keeping membership limited and the atmosphere informal. The first meeting of the year, held in October, would establish a schedule for the monthly lectures and possible dates for the exhibitions.

The first group exhibitions were held at Jarvis Wilson's studio but they were later moved to the Carnegie Library on Sparks Street. All photographs had to be printed, matted, and framed in a manner similar to that of a watercolour painting, and hung at a level that could provoke serious contemplation. Gallery-type exhibitions and salons allowed many camera clubs to promote photography as an artistic discipline. As Andrea Kunard posits,

---

58 Frank Shutt, “Minute Book,” 1908 -1922
59 Frank Shutt, “Minute Book,” Formally active between 1908 - 1922
60 William Ide, “Minute Book,” The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa (Library and Archives Canada).
Prior to the involvement of the Gallery, major camera clubs sought public support of photography by organizing annual salons. The club emulated art institutions’ practice to promote photography as a creative activity: photographs were framed, matted and hung in a manner that encouraged contemplative thinking.61

The use of visual art practices and the photographers’ unique vision and imagination changed how the public saw the image—to some extent—as something more than a truthful representation of what was in front of the lens. Topley and the members of the PAC continued to evolve and develop their photography as an artistic medium.

**Changes in the Perception of Photography**

Debates on photography as a science or an art form have existed since its invention. At first, the camera seemed more aligned with science than artistic expression. Early preparations of glass plate negatives or photosensitive papers were chemical processes, which the photographer produced with raw materials;62 however, the invention of the dry-plate negative transformed the profession by taking the preparation away from the professional and transferring it into the manufacturing plant, where plates were made in advance, stored, and sold at a later date.63 The wet plate had to be prepared and processed immediately, whereas the dry plate did not have that urgency. The glass plate was coated with a light-sensitive silver salt in the form of a gelatin emulsion.64 As a result, dry plates were said to be more convenient: they arrived perfectly coated, and, just as importantly, had more consistency in quality.65 Despite this

---

63 Richard Benson, 146
64 Richard Benson, 146
65 Richard Benson, 146
advance, as Peter Robertson discusses, the dry plate days would start to wane as early as 1888; however, glass negative would be still be used by professionals and amateurs alike up until to the 1920s, due to its stability. The Eastman Kodak Company’s development of celluloid film further generated a division between amateur and professional photographers. This partition changed photography exponentially and moved it into the hands of the middle class, who used it to capture their daily realities.

A secondary debate between the art and science of photography concerned the ability of the device to capture an unmediated view of reality. This dispute arose due to the amount of detail that photographs recorded; put simply, the image did not look like art. As Mary Warner Marien relates in *Photography: A Cultural History*, “An 1860 issue of the *Art Journal* contended that: ‘the photograph cannot deceive; in nothing can it extenuate; there is no power this marvelous machine either adds to or takes from: we know what we see must be true.’” The representation that the camera captured was accepted by the viewer and did not leave room for acceptance of the photographer’s skill. In an 1889 article entitled “Copyright” about his dissatisfaction with the image being generally accepted as mechanically produced, Topley penned the following:

> Even at this day we frequently are pestered by the criticisms of the ‘photographically ignorant,’ who treat our work as if the camera had been dropped by accident and suffered to ‘strike off’ the view, as they so accurately express themselves, never dreaming that the unfortunate camera-crank has spent hours, perhaps days, in deciding the points that led up to a successful composition, and who has, perhaps by the sweat of his brow, brought together such objects as were necessary to the finish of an effective foreground.

---


With this view as the consensus, it is no surprise that the camera was quickly adopted by the sciences, such as archaeology and botany. The photograph was a means of literal translation and could capture details that had not been seen before. The image was fixed on a metal plate, with glass or paper support, and then the image was taken by a machine and formed by light; to viewers, this process had little artistic merit.70

Nonetheless, Victorian photographers such as Topley saw the potential for artistic creativity. With advances in technology, photographers composed images that emulated paintings and, by adopting visual aesthetics from art, they changed society’s perspective on the discipline. British photographer C. Jabez Hughes (1819-1884) suggested that photography be divided into different categories: the “mechanical,” “art-photography,” and photography with “purpose.” The first form acted as a literal translation of reality, the second was produced when the photographer—not content with things as they appeared—created an image that was more than straight photography, and the last involved the creation of “certain pictures which aimed at a higher purpose than the majority of art-photographs, but whose aim is not merely to amuse, but to instruct, purify, and ennable.”71 These three categories illustrated how the medium could be used for very different purposes and allowed photographers to determine the level of use of the device and the intentions of the images.

During the 1880s, British photographer Henry Peach Robinson argued that photography was a medium that combined both science and art.72 The aesthetic was always in the hands of the photographer, who authored and creatively manipulated the

---

70 Nancy Locke, “How Photography Evolved from Science to Art.”
71 Mary Warner Marien, Photography: A Cultural History, 86.
image. Professionals and serious amateurs understood that, through both the manipulation of the camera and the use of darkroom techniques and various formal elements of composition, lighting, and tone, they could create an image that would elicit an emotional response. The softness of the image, similar to that of a painting, went against the conceptualization of the process as mechanical and diminished the harshness associated with it. In this way, photographs that resembled paintings were perceived to be less mechanical and more artistic.

The use of pictorial conventions from other visual media—mainly print media—was adopted and employed by photographers to advance the discipline. As Joel Snyder details, these conventions were shared by picture makers who worked in other print media—lithography, engraving, the various etching processes—as well as those who worked with paint on canvas. With print media, the public had accepted forms of art which made use of a machine. Thus, by studying other media, photographers used a combination of convention and imagination, allowing photography to be seen as an art medium in its own right. Previously, studio photographers such as Topley staged shots out of necessity due to prolonged exposure times that were needed to produce a clear image; however, shortened exposure times and the creation of more portable cameras allowed amateurs to take pictures that were previously the business of studio photographers.

Early photographic studio practices often relied on artists to touch up certain aspects of the image. Studios such as William Notman’s often hired artists to create backdrops, colourize images, or paint in a believable background. As was discussed in

74 Joel Snyder, 179.
the introduction, W.J. Topley worked as a tintypist before coming to Ottawa to manage Notman’s studio. In 1860, Notman, hired artist John Arthur Fraser to head the studio’s art department. According to accounts, Fraser was quite proficient at colourizing full portraits, which "displays an unusual degree of sensitivity and skill." As Dennis Reid describes, "In addition to supervising other staff artists he was producing much larger portraits, not only tinting the by-now usually full-length studio-photographed figure, but placing it within a convincing landscape setting that he painted directly onto the suitably large sheet of photosensitive paper from which all studio props had been carefully masked out in the printing." By 1868, Fraser had moved to Toronto to open Notman and Fraser Photographic Studio. His involvement with photography had a considerable influence on his own painting style. Fraser's landscape paintings were described as having a photographic realism about them. While running the Toronto studio, Fraser hired and also trained such artists as Homer Ransford Watson and Horatio Walker, to touch up photographic images. In addition, Fraser also trained the young artists imparting on this his wealth of artistic knowledge. It is this intermingling of art and photography practices that shows the various influences on photographers and the artists.

The rise of amateur photographers, who quickly adopted the camera as their own, led to the establishment of camera clubs. Camera clubs were places of learning

---

76 Dennis Reid, “Fraser, John Arthur”, Dictionary of Canadian Biography.
77 It is interesting to note that John A. Fraser, Horatio Walker, and Homer Watson, are three of the artists that have photographic reproductions in Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)
78 The rise in amateur photography was marked by the introduction of the Eastman Kodak #1 Camera in 1888. This extended into the mid-1900s as Kodak continued to simplify that camera and market it to the mainstream.
where amateurs could discuss the latest techniques with their peers, as well as benefit from the knowledge of professionals. Despite this collegial environment, there were distinctions made between professional photographers and enthusiasts. Moreover, another division developed within the amateur ranks. During the nineteenth century, casual amateurs snapped photographs that commemorated the milestone events in their personal lives and the everyday, with images glued into private albums to create personal visual repositories. The serious amateurs, on the other hand, were interested in advancing their skills, and “reacted to the snapshot craze by forming organizations dedicated to promoting photography as a fine art.” The serious amateur understood the fundamental techniques, such as darkroom skills, tonal quality, composition, and the use of various papers. The interest of the novice—like that of some members in the early days of the CCO—resided in learning how to take photographs, while leaving the technical work to others. As Robertson argues, “We see a growing divergence with the implications for the future: on the one hand quality, on the other quantity.” The professional had a reputation to uphold and a desire to produce works that had a distinctive aesthetic quality about them.

82 Peter Robertson, 29.
The Studio Album: Photographed Paintings of *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)*

A discussion of Topley's *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)* [Figure Intro. 3] (1895-1905) requires an exploration of the potential narrative of the interspersed contemporary paintings. The album reveals Topley's connection to the RCA, as the photographed reproductions were created by the artists of the academy. The images indicate a relationship between the artists and the photographer, which would have developed through a professional camaraderie and a comparable interest in the arts. The unassuming, black, leather-bound photo album contains ninety-nine albumen prints of the City of Ottawa and the surrounding area, including views of the Laurier Avenue Bridge [Figure 1.7], Christ Church Cathedral [Figure 1.8], and log driving on the Gatineau River [Figure 1.9]. The album displays the images on both the recto and verso of the grey cardstock—unlike the images in *Paysages canadiens*, which are singularly appear on the verso. The images are not organized in chronological order, nor do they indicate a personal preference. The works are titled, although often an abbreviated version was inscribed or a different title was given to the image. The first grouping of paintings starts on page 15 and continues through to page 35, with the next installment beginning on page 89 and concluding with the last work on page 99. Page numbers have been handwritten on the upper corner of each page.

---

83 It's impossible to give a specific date range for Album 29 due to the large range it entails; however, the first image is dated between 1895 and 1905. Later images in the album are dated before 1900, according to the LAC finding aid.

84 Albumen prints were invented in 1850, and are coated with egg whites (the albumen) to great a glossy look, then the paper is treated with a solution of silver nitrate, and placed under a glass-plate negative and exposed to light. The Tate, *Art Term*, [https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/a/albumen-print](https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/a/albumen-print)

85 Recto is the right-hand side of the page, and verso is the left-hand side of the page. The Tate [https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/v/verso-recto](https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/v/verso-recto)

86 Margaret Dixon and Shannon Perry in discussion with the author, Library and Archives Canada, Gatineau Preservation Centre, August 16, 2019.

87 It is not uncommon for an album to be taken apart and put back together in a haphazard order, either by the photographer or another person at a later date.
Matheson surmises that the numbers would have been written by the studio and not inscribed by an archivist.\textsuperscript{88} The paintings provide evidence of Topley’s interest in the visual arts.

The album showcased Topley’s diversity as a commercial photographer and was displayed in his studio parlour for clients to browse while waiting for their appointments. The first entry is a copy photograph of a watercolour painting depicting an architectural rendering of a sanatorium. The work bears two signatures: Weeks (Arthur LeBaron) [1881-1962] and Keefer (Allan) [1853-1952].\textsuperscript{89} The architectural firm of Weeks and Keefer was known for designing and building institutional structures in Ottawa between 1908 and 1910. The painting reproduced here was used as part of a bid on the construction of the proposed Lady Grey Hospital (The Royal Ottawa Sanitorium).\textsuperscript{90} The building was constructed in the Rockcliffe area but was torn down in the 1970s. The watercolour masterfully complements the architectural photography displayed in the album. The next page showcases Topley’s connections to the social elite in Ottawa.

The painting is entitled \textit{Portrait of a Lady}, or \textit{Portrait of Henrietta Skerrett Montalba} (1885) by Her Royal Highness, Princess Louise.\textsuperscript{91} The princess, along with her husband, Lord Lorne, were patrons of the RCA. Louise gifted the painting to the RCA, and the work is now part of the NGC’s collection. Although the painting was created at a later date, the princess loaned six of her drawings as part of the inaugural exhibition of

\textsuperscript{88} Jean Matheson in discussion with the author, Library and Archives Canada, Wellington Street, Ottawa, Ontario, March 10, 2020.
\textsuperscript{89} Weeks, Arthur Le Baron, and Keefer, Alan, Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada, 1800-1950. Date Accessed: December 2019
\textsuperscript{91} Louise Caroline Alberta, Portrait of Henrietta Skerrett-Montalba (1856-1893), 1882, oil on canvas, 108.5 x 87.4 cm, National Portrait Gallery.
A discussion of the importance of the marquis and the princess with the visual arts in Canada, and of Topley's involvement with them, will be forthcoming in this chapter.

The next few pages in the album feature a mix of genres and mediums, and include a landscape by Homer Watson entitled *The Hillside Gorge* (1890) [Figure 1.11], a genre scene by Paul Peel entitled *Mother Love* (1888) [Figure 1.12], and George Agnew Reid's *Mortgaging the Homestead* (1890) [Figure 1.13]. This section also features painter Lucius O'Brien's diploma work, *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880) [Figure 1.14], which is generally considered the first work deposited in the NGC collection. The works are not consistently the diploma pieces of the artists of the academy, but all of the artists involved were active and productive members of the RCA. In examining the logbook from the studio, eleven of the works are entered in sequence on the same page; however, this may not be an indication that the paintings were all photographed at the same time. My investigation of *Album 29* uncovers a connection between Topley and the RCA, with Topley acting as the commercial photographer for the academy from 1886 onward. I argue that it was this business arrangement that led to Topley's development as an aspiring artist.

W. J. Topley's involvement in the arts coincided with an exciting time during the development of cultural institutions in Canada, through art associations, the establishment of art schools, and, as discussed, the creation of our own national

---

92 Louise Caroline Alberta, “Henrietta Skerrett-Montalba,” Collection of the National Gallery of Canada Online.
93 In *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)*, pages 15 through 24 include paintings and one sculpture by various RCA artists.
repository of art. The diversity of Canadian visual arts ranged from genre scenes to agricultural views and images of the country’s vast wilderness; increasingly, many artists of the time turned to the landscape. In his article "Word and Image: North American Landscape in Nineteenth-century Illustrated Publications," Brian Foss argues that,

Landscape painting was central to nineteenth-century national self-definition in the United States and Canada. It was, according to James Jackson Jarves in 1866, “the thoroughly American branch of painting.” Yet for much of the century, North America landscape was associated, in novels, poetry, travel narratives and tourist guides, with the picturesque aesthetics informed by established European conventions that encouraged the viewers to idealize, poetize and appreciate landscapes as works of art.  

The landscape would be idealized and romanticized well into the twentieth century. Countless Canadian artists travelled to Europe to study and brought back various approaches to paint the country’s unique landscapes. However, not all artists travelled abroad to develop their skills, and some chose to study under established artists in the new Canadian institutions that were flourishing at the time. Learning the skills of the craft at home may have contributed to many preferring to depict their own national landscapes.

Over half of the photographic reproductions in the album are landscape views (with the remaining images divided between portraits and genre scenes), which demonstrates the popularity of the subject matter. Many artists and commercial photographers benefitted from offering reproductions of artworks for sale.  

---


example, Montreal photographer William Notman produced a series called

Photographic Selections (1863), which contained not only various types of photographs taken by his studio but also photographic reproductions of engravings by Old Masters.\(^97\)

Contemporary artists whose works were featured in such photographic presentations also benefitted from being seen by a larger viewing audience. It was not uncommon for artists to have their works photographed for various publications or for their records. Photographic reproductions of paintings were now commonly displayed and printed in popular travel narratives or guides. W. J. Topley’s preference for Canadian landscape art seems apropos of the development of the visual arts in the post-Confederation period.

The Stamp of Modernity and the Adaptation of Fine Art Traditions

Connoisseurs of the arts in post-Confederation Canada had clear notions of what a landscape should look like, based on the tropes of traditional fine art. Many landscape photographers adapted compositional elements and subject matter from painting. Jennifer Green-Lewis states, “One reason is that although photography by 1881 was more than forty years old, it still had the stamp of modernity. As much as photography was invested in the past, its way of looking is allied with the present and therefore, with the new.”\(^98\) In order to shed this perception of being aligned with the modern and the new, photographers utilized the tenets of fine art to create images that were more than just mechanically recorded images. James Ackerman claims, “That

---


many practitioners chose to use fine art as a model was due to its elevated status.”99 The Picturesque was declining by the mid-nineteenth century. However, here in Canada, many artists still used the tropes of Picturesque in landscape painting in a distinctly Canadian way. Many artists and photographers found that “a variety of intimate spaces filled with diverse intricate details, could both arouse curiosity, and provide satisfaction for viewers who sought evidence of the harmony in nature.”100 The Picturesque was espoused in many literary and artistic publications. George Monro Grant and Lucius R. O’Brien’s publication *Picturesque Canada: the country as it was and is*, which was published in 1882, was an extensive work that included 452 illustrations produced by some of the artists of the RCA.101 These renditions of the Canadian landscape established what many viewers came to expect of the country’s landscapes.

Many photographers followed suit and experimented with various aesthetic elements to create more expressive and individualized images.102 Canadian artists and photographers tended to follow traditional European models of art; yet, despite photographers’ efforts to align their work with fine art, photography had no established traditions of its own. This led to great innovation in the field. Marylin McKay describes how, “As a new medium, it had no clear commitment to rules of established fine arts. . . Canadian photographers tended to be members of a younger generation and therefore

101 Dennis Reid, ‘Our Own Country Canada:’ *Being an Account of the National Aspirations of the Principal Landscape Artists in Montreal and Toronto, 1860-1890* (Ottawa: National Gallery of Canada, 1979), 298.
102 James S. Ackerman, “The Photographic Picturesque,” 91.
Photographers wanted the medium to be linked to traditional art movements, which would redefine the discipline and encourage middle-class consumers to embrace it. Contemporary professional photographers, such as Topley, were looking for new ways to keep their profession elevated and separated from the amateurs who were taking pictures; as such, it became necessary for photography to develop its own artistic movement.

From the Picturesque came Pictorialism. Pictorialism was a photographic arts movement that adapted some of the tropes used by the Picturesque for use with photography. The movement flourished between 1885 and lasted until the 1920s. Although this movement was international in scope, the leading pictorialist in the United States was Alfred Stiglitz, head of the Photo-Session movement, who created images that went, “far beyond the commonplace record, to expressions of beauty and spirit.”

In Canada, Sidney Carter, a Montreal Pictorialist, argued that there was a new status for photography, and that the medium had its "own canon of art, range, and practice." As Lilly Koltun states, "Undoubtedly the most significant movement in Canada after 1900 was Pictorialism. Slowly at first, this new orientation began to affect not only who took pictures, but specifically how those pictures looked."

Pictorialism sought to emulate traditional fine art practices by imitating pictorial effects found in painting and...
graphic arts. Soft focus, the suppression of detail, a hazy atmospheric effect, and dramatic lighting were achieved through the photographers' manipulation of the photograph, which did not fit the previous conception of the mechanical image. Both the image and its negative could be manipulated to produce artistic details.\textsuperscript{108} Technique, once mastered became unimportant for many pictorialists and the results had to be more than just an image on paper.\textsuperscript{109} Topley was experimental in his use of these techniques as he was strongly influenced by contemporary art, as will be discussed in the next chapter.

\section*{W. J. Topley and his Connections with the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts and the National Gallery of Canada (1886 - 1912)}

Topley, as Ottawa's most prominent portrait photographer, had the opportunity to photograph the works of the RCA, photographing the various committees and installations from 1886 onward. He was also personally invested in promoting the visual arts. Topley sat on the boards of various Ottawa art associations and was called upon to photograph exhibition installations and RCA members. In March 1897, he photographed the hanging committee for the Tenth Annual Exhibition of the RCA, which included then president Lucius R. O'Brien [Figure 1.15].\textsuperscript{110} The commission was a business arrangement and developed out of Topley’s personal involvement with the

\begin{footnotes}
\item \textsuperscript{108} Lilly Koltun, "Art Ascendant, 1900-1914", 32.
\item \textsuperscript{109} Robert Doty, \textit{Photo Secession}, 28.
\item \textsuperscript{110} Royal Canadian Academy of Arts Committee, Photography by William James Topley, National Gallery of Canada. EX0006.
\end{footnotes}
various committees on which he served. However, despite the commercial aspect, these relationships proved to be inspiring to Topley and his aspiration to become a photographic artist.

Through his clientele, Topley gained access to the social elite in Ottawa and developed close relationships with many of the governors-general. He found favour with Sir John Douglas Sutherland Campbell, Marquis of Lorne, and his wife, Her Royal Highness Princess Louise. In his role as an official photographer to the vice-regent, Topley photographed the couple many times and attended numerous events at Rideau Hall in a professional capacity. When their role in Canada ended, Princess Louise requested a commemorative album of her years in the nation’s capital. The subsequently created *Princess Louise Album* (1878-1882) included many of Topley’s images of the Saguenay, various views of Ottawa, and images of her art studio [Figure 1.16 & 1.17]. Few would have had access to the private spaces of people of such high standing. The governor-general and Her Excellency played key roles in directing the arts in Canada, aiding with the creation of the NGC and patronizing the RCA. The suggestion is that Topley and the governor-general had a rapport that went beyond business, and that they may have had the opportunity to discuss his artistic interests through these interactions.

As Canada’s new governor-general, Lord Lorne embraced the grand plans initiated by Lord Dufferin for the new dominion. He aided in the formation of cultural institutions and the country’s first national repository of art. The objective was to create cultural organizations similar to those in Britain.\(^{111}\) It was not long before the vice-

---

president of the Ontario Society of Artists (OSA), Lucius O’Brien, met with the governor-general and asked if he and Princess Louise would consider being the society’s patrons, as Lord and Lady Dufferin had done previously. O’Brien saw the need for artists in the new dominion to be viewed as professionals and he sought recognition on an international scale.\textsuperscript{112} As discussed above, many Canadian artists often travelled to Europe for arts education. Lorne and O’Brien wanted to create academies and art schools in Canada to encourage artists to train here. This dream came to fruition on May 26\textsuperscript{th}, 1879 with the opening of the Ontario School of Art.\textsuperscript{113} Subsequent collaborations between the Marquis of Lorne and O’Brien included the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts (RCA), which, in turn, would aid in the formation of the National Gallery of Canada (NGC).\textsuperscript{114}

The Canadian Academy of Arts held its first exhibition on March 6\textsuperscript{th}, 1880 (it added “Royal” to its name later that summer), at the former Clarendon Hotel on Sussex Street in Ottawa.\textsuperscript{115} The RCA was central to the establishment of the NGC through its donation of diploma works, as requested by the governor-general.\textsuperscript{116} As part of its mandate, the RCA was to have an annual juried exhibition, which rotated and traveled to the major centres of the nation. His Excellency wrote,

\[\text{[w]hen I or some more fortunate successor may be called upon to open the first exhibition of the ROYAL CANADIAN ACADEMY to be held each year in one of the capitals of our several provinces; an academy which may, like that of the Old}\]

\textsuperscript{113} Dennis Reid, \textit{Lucius R. O’Brien: Visions of Victorian Canada} (Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario, 1990), 44.  
\textsuperscript{114} Rebecca Sisler, \textit{Passionate Spirits}, 26.  
\textsuperscript{116} \textit{Royal Canadian Academy of Arts Records of the Founding by his Excellency, The Marquis of Lorne and Her Royal Highness Princess Louise}. Catalogue Records for 1883 (Toronto: Globe Printing Company Printers and Engravers, 1883), 7.
Country, be able to insist that each of its members or associates should on their election paint for it a diploma picture . . . .

The first exhibition included work by artists Lucius O'Brien, Frederick Verner, John Arthur Fraser, and Robert Harris. Interestingly, works by many of these artists are also reproduced in Topley’s *Album 29*, although the works are from later exhibitions. These artists were among many who made significant contributions to art during this period.

The involvement of Topley with the RCA took two forms. First, as noted above, as a commercial photographer Topley would photograph the jury committees for many of the exhibition catalogues, as well as the installation of the artworks. The business aspect of the arrangement allowed Topley to become acquainted with many of the artists of the RCA, which I believe fueled his artistic aspirations. Second, as a supporter of the arts, Topley’s name appears as an honorary member in the 1886 exhibition catalogue of the RCA [Figure 1.18]. Honorary members were invited to support the academy “by subscribing not less than one dollar per annum, and the Secretary shall acknowledge the receipt of the subscription by a card, such card to be presented at the annual Re-union [sic] in proof of membership.”

It was considered a privilege to be seen as someone who supported the arts and the RCA. However astute this business move was for Topley, it is hard to ignore the artistic friendships that developed due to his connection to the RCA and the NGC.

---


118 William Notman of Montreal took photographs for the first exhibition catalogue; however, the next few Ottawa catalogues were photographed by W.J. Topley.


Artist Peleg Franklin Brownell (1857-1946) [Figure 1.19] is frequently mentioned in the minute book as having attended meetings of the PAC between 1916 and 1921. Brownell was an American from Boston who moved to Ottawa in 1886 and came to replace William Brymner as headmaster of the Ottawa School of Art.\textsuperscript{121} Brymner and Brownell had met in France while studying at the esteemed Académie Julian.\textsuperscript{122} After relocating to Ottawa, Brownell became deeply involved in the artistic community of his adopted country, developing many cultural and social connections in the capital. He was a member of and exhibited with the RCA. He became involved in its affairs and the arranging of the annual exhibitions from 1889 onward. Through his involvement with the RCA and the NGC, he was able to participate in guiding the direction of fine arts in Canada. He also exhibited with the Art Association of Montreal and the Ontario Society of Artists,\textsuperscript{123} and was on the board of the prestigious Art Association of Ottawa, which included Topley as a member.\textsuperscript{124}

Brownell became a member of the RCA in 1895 with his diploma piece \textit{The Photographer} [Figure 1.20].\textsuperscript{125} The painting displays the photographer surround various photographic paraphernalia of his trade. The work indicates an intimacy and an unspoken camaraderie between the artist and the photographer [Figure 1.21] and shows Brownell’s interest in photography. As Jim Burant states of Brownell,

\begin{quote}
His circle also included William J. Topley, a founder of both the School of Art and the Ottawa Camera Club, the owner of Topley Studio, Ottawa’s leading
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{122} Victoria Baker, “Brymner, William,” \textit{Dictionary of Canadian Biography, Volume XV}
\textsuperscript{124} Jim Burant, 23.
commercial photography studio from 1868 to 1923, and likely the subject of Brownell’s diploma piece, *The Photographer.*

Interestingly, Topley includes a copy print of Brownell’s canvas *Lamplight* (1892) in *Album 29* [Figure 1.22]. Early in his career, Brownell was well known as a portrait painter, but he later dedicated more time to painting landscapes, which included the Ottawa/Gatineau area [Figure 1.23] and distinct locales across the country, among them the Saguenay region.

Their shared work as portraitists, albeit in different disciplines, gave Topley and Brownell common interests. Brownell is included in many of Topley’s photographs of RCA juries and hanging committees. Brownell was clearly an active member of the PAC and the minutes relay that Brownell frequented many outings with the camera club, and gave several lectures as well. There is no mention of him taking photographs, but Topley and Brownell’s connection was nevertheless more than just a business arrangement; it was a friendship based on a common interest in the visual arts.

In conclusion, this chapter has presented a new perspective on W. J. Topley by demonstrating that he was a photographer active in the visual arts in Canada and that he was keenly interested in developing photography as an art form. Topley’s reputation, his association with the governors-general of Canada, with artists and with art associations, and his work for the RCA and the NGC all illustrate his business connections; however, they also reveal a man who had an interest in all aspects of the visual arts. The formation of the elite Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa, with its

---

mandate to limit membership, enabled a more focused development of skills and discussion of issues of photography at a shared level of proficiency. Topley’s oeuvre includes landscapes that number in the hundreds, and his work needs to be studied in relation to the arts. These landscapes are, in my estimation, more than a collection of touristic images or commercial products. The photographs of paintings in *Album 29* (*Ottawa & Paintings*) illustrate that he had access to major works of contemporary Canadian art, which granted him the opportunity to study them as a way to improve his own work.

The next chapter will examine the three-volume set of landscape photographs, *Paysages canadiens*, in order to illustrate Topley’s artistic aspirations. The works focus on specific regions of the province of Quebec, and show a thoughtful working out of compositional elements. As well, the images reveal a strong resemblance to Lucius O’Brien’s *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880).
Chapter Two
Images of the Saguenay Region: William James Topley’s Saguenay Landscapes

In a moment, its weird fascination has seized you, and will hold you spell bound, so long as you sail through the stillness that broods over the mountain shores which confine its deep black waters.

J. A. G. Creighton
“The Lower St. Lawrence and the Saguenay”,
Picturesque Canada: The Country as It Was and Is (1882)

Contained in one of the volumes of Paysages canadiens II (1878-1882) is a majestic photographic view of Cape Trinity [Figure 2.1] along the Saguenay River in the province of Quebec. The composition depicts the massive rock formation of granite and gneiss, which completely dwarfs a canoe containing two people below the rock. The waters at the base of Cape Trinity are tranquil and serene. The composition then leads the eye across the bay to Trinity’s twin, Cape Eternity and beyond, giving an impression of endlessness. The only clearly defined details are the bluff’s rockiness, with trees that claim a foothold where they can. The image’s narrative suggests that nature can adapt to the most inhospitable of places. The photographer uses the point of the bluff to direct the eye to the canoe, which is below the vanishing point, and both the bluff and the canoe are slightly below the centre of the frame. The image exhibits William J. Topley’s deep understanding of the compositional elements conventionally used in the visual arts. The minuscule canoe in contrast to the massive bluffs indicates an understanding

---

129 LAC gives approximate dates for the three volumes of Paysages canadien, as the dates when the volumes were assembled is unknown. As well, it is not known exactly what year Topley was in the Saguenay, as The Topley Series Index does not assign dates to the glass plate negatives.
130 Ellen Ramsay, “Picturing the Picturesque,” 163.
of the Victorian interpretation of the Sublime\textsuperscript{131}; the photograph suggests the
insignificance of man in comparison to nature. In using the compositional tropes of fine
art, Topley is attempting to create photographic art.

This chapter analyzes Paysages canadiens, a series of three albums by W. J.
Topley, to illustrate his progression towards developing a practice of landscape
photography as art.\textsuperscript{132} The preceding chapter made use of Album 29 (Ottawa &
Paintings) to demonstrate Topley’s relationship to the arts in Canada. This chapter
introduces Paysages canadiens as an exploration of Topley's landscape images
depicting the Saguenay River region and also presents the far-reaching effects that this
area had on the arts at the time.\textsuperscript{133} The Saguenay River was a popular destination for
tourists and contemporary artists but it was becoming highly industrialized through
extensive logging. I argue that Topley creates a narrative that speaks to the viewer on a
more emotional level by adapting compositional elements from painting to photographs.
Finally, I will analyze a few specific photographs from the second volume, and compare
them to Lucius O’Brien’s definitive work, Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880).
I will consider the Cape Trinity photographs as works that illustrate O'Brien's influence
on Topley and his admiration of the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts’ (RCA) landscape
artists.

\textsuperscript{131} The Sublime, in aesthetics is a concept that is discussed in the various disciplines of the arts, which
describes a quality of greatness, morality, spiritual or artistic quality in nature. In relationship to the landscape the
experience gives the sense of awe, or terror, when one encounters the immensity (Capes Trinity and Eternity),
uncontrollable, the wild or the dangerous.

\textsuperscript{132} The Topley Studios fonds contains 29 assembled albums and 68 counter books with portraits glued with
some sense of order.

\textsuperscript{133} The Library and Archives Finding Aid have the albums numbered as 82, 83 and 84, but these numbers
are not printed on the spines.
Paysages canadiens: Landscape Photographs or Commercial Images?

The scenes in *Paysages canadiens*, which were photographed and assembled by Topley, centre on three local regions in Quebec. The volumes do not have specific titles, unlike *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)*, but each is given a number. *Paysages Canadiens* is embossed on the spines in uppercase lettering, as is the number of each respective album (*Topley I.*, *Topley II.*, or *Topley III.*). The first album is identified by Library and Archives Canada (LAC) records as Album 82, and depicts the St. John Bay area (Lac St. Jean), Chicoutimi, Bardsville and the other locales which the Prince of Wales visited in 1860 during a goodwill tour of Canada.134 The second album is identified by LAC as Album 83; the images contained in this volume depict Tadoussac, Pointe Rouge, and the vistas of the Saguenay River. The final volume in the collection is identified by LAC as Album 84. The focus of this album is Rivière du Loup and Murray Bay (renamed La Malbaie). Each album is dedicated to a specific area; however, there are a few images that appear out of context with the narrative of their corresponding volume. This is possibly due to the reassembly of the album at some point. The series was placed in the Library of Parliament but has since become part of the Topley Studios fonds at Library and Archives Canada.135

Each volume of *Paysages canadiens* takes the form of a ‘viewbook,’ a type of travel publication that was popular at the turn of the century. A Victorian viewbook contains mainly photographs of scenic views such as landscapes.136 For some, it was a

---

way to see places to which they could not travel; for others, viewbooks served as mementos of past trips. Typically, albums of the time were covered in leather and had a metal clasp to protect the prints from the light.\textsuperscript{137} The volumes of \textit{Paysages canadiens} are constructed in the same manner in that each album is bound in burgundy-coloured leather with gold-embossed lettering on the spine. In total, the three albums hold a total of 124 photographs. Each single 8x10 albumen print is mounted on a cream-coloured board, which is tipped-in on to the recto of the album page [Figure 2.2]. Due to the thinness of the paper, albumen prints were mounted or tipped onto card stock to prevent curling after drying. Unlike many of Topley's studio albums, \textit{Paysages canadiens} only contains photographs on the recto of each page. Also of note are inconsistencies in pagination. For example, \textit{Topley I} starts with page 43 and ends with page 79. \textit{Topley II} begins with page 1, and ends on page 42; additionally, within this volume, there are duplications of pages numbered 3 and 35. Despite this pagination, \textit{Topley II} contains 44 physical pages. Finally, \textit{Topley III} starts with page number 84, and ends with page 124.\textsuperscript{138} Each landscape is characteristic of the specific location and chronicles a visual narrative indicative of that area.

The landscape takes precedence in each of the albums. With one image per page, the albums present the viewer with uninterrupted and thoughtful images to admire, in an experience similar to that of viewing an art exhibition. Although the

\textsuperscript{137} Richard Benson, \textit{The Printed Picture}, 116.

\textsuperscript{138} A curiosity was found with three images in the album. The images were dated 1860 whereas none of the others in the three albums a similar notation. In consultation with the librarian, the dates were placed there by Topley's studio. After consulting the LAC website, I found that the image was said to have been taken in 1860; however, Topley was born in 1845; this would have made him 15 years of age in 1860. Topley only started his own studio in 1872 and was in the Saguenay region between 1878-1883. It was discovered that all three images were of locations that the Prince of Wales had visited when he was in Canada in 1860. The titles corroborate this link as they are written in the past tense.
extraction of natural resources is indicated in the three albums, it remains only a minor aspect. Countless photographs include some indication of human presence, either through the depiction of a single person or a human-made object, such as an empty canoe. As well, the landscapes often include recreational activities that were popular in many of the regions of Quebec, such as fishing [Figure 2.3], sailing [Figure 2.4], and hunting [Figure 2.5]. The compositions show an attempt to incorporate a more artistic conceptualization into the albums. These themes will be discussed in greater depth later in the chapter. Although the images are part of Topley's commercial business, they exhibit a more artistic flair.

According to the *Topley Stock Series Index* [Figure 2.6], the images in the albums were taken between 1878 and 1882; however, assigning an exact date to any of the negatives is difficult as the appointment books and the indexes are inconsistent. The studio only introduced monthly and yearly dates after 1910. Topley's personal ledger, which includes clients' names and the number of each glass plate, was deemed a sufficient finding aid.

It was not uncommon for multiple prints to be made from a single glass plate negative and for these prints to appear in various albums. Numerous images of the Saguenay displayed in *Paysages canadiens* have been reprinted and appear in other Topley albums, demonstrating the region's popularity and importance. The photograph titled *The Foot of Cape Eternity* [Figure 2.7], for example, can be seen in different albums such as Album 159 (*Tadousac [sic] and the Saguenay*) [Figure 2.8] (possibly

---

139 The Topley Studio fonds contains a ledger titled *Topley Stock Series Index*, which gives the negative number of the photographs that were taken for commercial purposes.

140 Upon a closer inspection, the works look to be in some form of order but this ordering possibly occurred at a much later date.
1868-1926) and Album 160 (St. Marguerite) [Figure 2.9] (1880s)\textsuperscript{141}, as well as in a collection of photographs entitled the *Princess Louise Album*.\textsuperscript{142} These three albums show how Topley and many other photographers, reused images in different photo albums. Nevertheless, it is hard to say with certainty what the original purpose of the photographs in *Paysages Canadiens* may have been.\textsuperscript{143} However, the albums do demonstrate Topley's interest in the landscape and his conviction that photography was an art form.

*Topley II* concentrates on the Saguenay region, which is renowned for its natural ruggedness and beauty. Despite its reputation as a site of wilderness, the area was highly industrialized through logging and mineral mining. Logging activities could be seen from the decks of the steamers and noticed by tourists. One tourist mentioned that there was no rich foliage, and that forest fires—for clearing land—had ravaged the area.\textsuperscript{144} The Saguenay, along with the St. Maurice Valley, was central to Canada's logging industry, covering 260,000 square kilometres of dense forest;\textsuperscript{145} however, the development of the nation's natural resources posed a paradox for many Canadians, who were of two minds over the expansion of resource extraction in the area. As Marylin McKay states, tourists “were pleased with the material progress which had overtaken the wilderness. On the other hand—paradoxically—they feared the loss of

\textsuperscript{141} Again, the dates are estimates that relate to the possible dates the images were taken. Topley often reused his images in various albums and publications.

\textsuperscript{142} The *Princess Louise Album* includes images from well-known photographers Alexander Henderson and William Notman, to name but a few. The album contains images of her time here in Canada that would have been meaningful to the Princess. The choice of photographs shows that his interest was diverse, as the collection included images of landmarks and localized scenes of Ottawa, as well as various landscapes from across the country.

\textsuperscript{143} The original purpose is not clear because there is little extant written documentation on the subject. While conducting an investigation of the written documentation for Topley Studios, I could not find the entries for some of the glass plate negatives for *Paysages canadiens*. Finding the precise date of the albums is not possible at this time.

\textsuperscript{144} Ellen Ramsay, “Picturing the Picturesque,” 164-165.

\textsuperscript{145} Ellen Ramsay, 164.
the wilderness, and the intense personal and nomadic experiences it offered. They wanted both."146 Topley and painter Lucius O'Brien, as well as other artists, would have seen the clear-cut mountain tops but they chose to omit the industrialization, deciding to emphasize the natural beauty of the region. Tourism was thriving, and the impact of emphasizing industrialization in their images would have drastically changed the tourist industry. Instead, the artists chose to focus on a romantic idea of the wilderness that would appeal to viewers; this choice resulted in the creation of images that would leave a lasting impression, which many would admire, write about, and capture on canvas or in photographs.

**The Saguenay: Scenic Tourism and the Romance of the Excursion**

The Saguenay or the "Great River of Canada," as it was called at the time, flows into the St. Lawrence at Tadoussac. The river is 336 kilometres north of Quebec City, runs approximately 235 kilometers in length and, interestingly, is the only navigable fjord in North America, as well as one of the longest in the world.147 Fjords, in oceanographic terminology, are described "as estuaries, which are semi-enclosed bodies of water in which seawater is measurably diluted by freshwater from land drainage."148 The cliffs which surround the shores of the river reach their highest peak at Cape Eternity, which measures five hundred and forty metres high.149 The Capes (the promontories of Trinity and Eternity, beside each other) lie fifty-five kilometres up river from the St. Lawrence,

---

146 Marylin McKay, *Picturing the Land*, 167.
149 According to Marsh, Trinity is 518 metres (1699.58 feet) in height and Eternity is 540 metres (1771.65 feet) in height.
with its headwaters commencing at Lac St-Jean. Until the twentieth century, the Saguenay River was surpassed as a major Canadian tourist destination only by Niagara Falls.150 The Saguenay was celebrated in travel literature, engravings, dioramas, and stereographs, as well as in paintings.151 Tourists were drawn to the excursion in order to experience something other than the mundane tasks of daily life; they associated the wildness of nature with beauty, unpredictability and exoticism. Many guidebooks and contemporary newspapers described the untamed and picturesque quality associated with the wilderness of Quebec as “transforming from the beautiful, to the picturesque, to the sublime.”152 An early article written by Charles Lanman, entitled “A Tour of the River Saguenay in Lower Canada” and published in 1848, provides a characteristic description:

Awful beyond expression, I can assure you, is the sensations which one experiences in sailing along the Saguenay, to raise his eyes heavenward, and behold hanging, directly over his head, a mass of granite, apparently ready to totter and fall, and weighing perhaps, a million tons. Terrible and Sublime, beyond the imagery of the most daring poet, are these cliffs; and while they proclaim the omnipotent power of God, they, at the same time, whisper into the ear of man that he is but as a moth, which flutters in the noontide air.153 Lanman’s description gives the reader the overpowering sense of the Sublime that would come to be associated with excursions to the Saguenay. The metaphor of a man as a moth in the sight of the rocks is powerful. Sites of rugged wilderness were sought

---


after as part of the Victorian excursionist experience; however, the majority of tourists would return to the hotels to partake of the picturesque views of the landscape while simultaneously enjoying the comforts of civilization. According to J. I. Little, the Victorian excursion was "essentially a passive, civilizing experience in which participants affirmed their aesthetic sensibility and social status by admiring the view of the lake and mountains from boat decks and hotel verandahs." Amenities developed along waterways such as the Saguenay River, where the excursion was popular, and contributed to the civilizing experience. Nevertheless, it was far from idyllic; during the summer, a crowded steamer would leave Quebec City for Tadoussac, Chicoutimi and various other tourist destinations. The boats were filled with holidaymakers who had their own pretty country houses in which they could live the quiet summer life. If a day of boating, picnicking, or fishing did not provide enough entertainment, resorts fulfilled this requirement with a dance, concert, or even a theatrical event.

Many tourist guides and travel accounts describe the Saguenay's natural beauty, focusing on the region's geology with its rock formations, chasms, and gorges. An entry in an exemplary early American travel guide, *Littell's Living Age* (October 1851), gives an apt description of Capes Trinity and Eternity:

"...[T]he twin promontories, whose names Eternity and Trinity, record the astonishment of the early explorers as they rowed in the show of their gigantic battlements. These two rock, or rather mountains, stand near together upon the western shore; the highest at two thousand one hundred feet from the surface of the water; they are nearly perpendicular, though one of them I think, Eternity—after rising a thousand feet or more, projects slightly forward its jagged summit, as if, at some expected signal, to plunge down and fill the chasm."

---

154 J. I. Little, “Scenic tourism,” 716. J. I. Little is describing the Eastern Townships; however, many Victorian excursionists travelled throughout the province, and the apt description applies well to the Saguenay.

155 Ellen Ramsay “Picturing the Picturesque,” 164.

156 Ellen Ramsey, 158.

An 1862 account by a Mr. Wood, is another travel narrative, that describes the two capes as visions that were not for the faint of heart:

Cape Eternity certainly shows no sign of relaxing in this respect from its deep savage grandeur. It is one tremendous cliff of limestone, more than 1500 feet high, and inclining forward nearly 200 feet, brow-beating all beneath it, and seeming as if at any moment it would fall and overwhelm the deep black stream which flows down so cold, so deep and motionless below.\textsuperscript{158}

Several steamer companies operated out of Quebec City and advertised a three-day adventure in the Saguenay. One such company was the St. Lawrence Steam Navigation Company Line, and an 1875 article from\textit{The Quebec and Lower St. Lawrence Tourist's Guide} gives an account on what the excursion entailed:

The crowning feature of the excursion was a trip up the romantic Saguenay river. The party left Quebec Tuesday morning in the fine Steamer Saguenay, Captain Michel Lecours, of the St. Lawrence Steam Navigation Company's line, which maintains almost daily communication with Ha! Ha! Bay and Chicoutimi during the season of summer travel.\textsuperscript{159}

Many of the cruises commenced at Quebec City, travelled up the St. Lawrence, and stopped at the mouth of the Saguenay, at the village of Tadoussac. They then would proceed upriver to Ha-Ha Bay and Chicoutimi.\textsuperscript{160}

Tourists would experience the fjord in all its glory and enjoy other picturesque views from the deck of the steamers. In essence, they encountered the Sublime in nature directly. According to Patricia Vervoort,

On the return journey in the morning, it was customary to pause beneath Capes Trinity and Eternity, With the engines shut down and passengers accustomed to the silence, the ships then blasted their horns or fired guns to produce echoes.

\textsuperscript{158} Nicholas Augustus Woods, “The Lower St. Lawrence, or, Quebec to Halifax via Gaspé and Pictou: to which is appended Mr. Wood's description of the River Saguenay: also, legends of the St. Lawrence and all about fishing,”\textit{Quebec Mercury}, Canadiana, 1862, 48, (ebook). http://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.36631/55?r=0&s=1.


On some voyages, the crew provided the passengers with pebbles to throw at Trinity or to drop into the ‘bottomless’ depths of the river.\textsuperscript{161}

The sound of the ship’s horn would bounce off of the rock formations, making a deafening noise; altogether, the trip was purported to supply an experience for all of the senses.\textsuperscript{162} Contemporary travel narratives declared that the Saguenay displayed the raw, pristine power of the massive cliffs, and the depth and darkness of the river. All of these elements combined to create the thrill of the Sublime. The Sublime was key to the experience but not one that would endanger paying customers.

**Royalty, Writers, Artists, and the Popularity of the “Great River of Canada”**

The popularity of the Saguenay region was widespread in the Victorian era. Royalty, writers, painters, and photographers converged on the region to experience the natural beauty of the landscape. Among them, in 1860, the Prince of Wales (later Edward VII) arrived in the Saguenay for a “few days of fishing.”\textsuperscript{163} Although Topley was not present during the royal tour of the Prince of Wales, the royal visit was still deemed so important that the photographer referenced it years later. The region was also frequented by many of the governors-general of Canada, including the Marquis of Lorne and his predecessor, Lord Dufferin [Figure 2.10].\textsuperscript{164} The Marchioness of Dufferin’s journal from 1872 to 1878 makes numerous references to the Saguenay, including the fishing in the area, and the Dufferin’s summer home at Tadoussac.\textsuperscript{165} Although the

\textsuperscript{161} Patricia Vervoort, 125.
\textsuperscript{162} François-Marc Gagnon, “The Forest, Niagara and the Sublime,” 34.
\textsuperscript{163} Nicolas Augustus Woods, “The Lower St. Lawrence,” 44.
\textsuperscript{164} Ellen Ramsay, “Picturing the Picturesque,” 163.
\textsuperscript{165} Patricia Vervoort, “‘Sunrise’ on the Saguenay,” 130.
Marchioness' journal entries do not describe the scenery\textsuperscript{166} of the Saguenay, they do focus on her interest in the fishing along the river.

Narratives about the Saguenay’s sublime scenery were not in short supply. Walt Whitman and Henry David Thoreau, for example, wrote accounts of their travels to the area. Whitman proclaimed that "the Saguenay was different from all other rivers," and that the sight would "linger on the memory forever."\textsuperscript{167} Thoreau took a week to explore the various regions of Quebec in 1850. Leaving from Boston, his route took him to Montreal, Quebec City, and the Saguenay. The American authors’ publications contribute to the popularity of the Saguenay. No trip to the province was complete without an excursion to the “Great River of Canada”.

The Narrative of Lucius O’Brien’s “Great River of Canada”: *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880)

One of the most celebrated works of art from this time—during the height of the "Great River of Canada's" popularity—was Lucius O'Brien's diploma painting, *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880) [Figure 2.11]. The work was one of several paintings of the area and was conceived during sketching trips over the course of three summers in the region. *Sunrise on the Saguenay* was given a place of honour in the inaugural exhibition of the RCA, as reported in the March 20\textsuperscript{th}, 1880 issue of the *Canadian Illustrated News*. The painting has been continuously on display since its acquisition by the National Gallery of Canada (NGC), and is considered the foundational

\textsuperscript{166} There are discrepancies in his descriptions of the area. One such error details how the St. Lawrence is 18 miles wide where the Saguenay joins at the falls near St. Anne; however, St. Anne is 182 kilometres from the mouth of the Saguenay.

\textsuperscript{167} Patricia Vervoort, “‘Sunrise’ on the Saguenay,” 132.
work of the collection.\textsuperscript{168} O’Brien likely selected this specific locale because of its popularity and the material wealth of the region. As was earlier discussed, the region was a well-known tourist destination, the subject of travel literature, and a resource-rich zone of industrialization, and thus would have been significant to many audiences.\textsuperscript{169}

What distinguishes this work is O’Brien’s expert understanding of the topology of his subject matter and his use of Romanticism\textsuperscript{170} to narrate certain historical understandings within the painting. \textit{Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity} is monumental and serene, with the brigantine sailing into the bay in the middle distance of the work. The sailing ship symbolizes the power and naval supremacy of the British Empire, as well as the conquering of a new nation and its wilderness through the industrialization of the region. O’Brien chose to focus on the lushness of the landscape and omitted the sites of logging in the area. The environment directs the eye, starting with the debris on the beach, to the man-made objects and man himself, illustrating human supremacy over nature. O’Brien depicts the water as tranquil in the misty early morning light. The foreground includes other small vessels; one ship is towing a canoe, and slightly behind is another canoe paddling out into the bay. The fishers may be heading out to do some early morning fishing. The narrative suggests the beginning of a new day and a new country full of optimism and promise.


\textsuperscript{169} The painting demonstrates O’Brien’s knowledge of the topology and the geological formations, which he gained during his years as a civil engineer, as well as his awareness of Lord Lorne’s preferences in art.

\textsuperscript{170} The Tate defines Romanticism as a, “term in use by the early nineteenth century to describe the movement in art and literature distinguished by a new interest in human psychology, expression of personal feeling and interest in the natural world.” The Tate, Art Terms, https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/r/romanticism
In *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity*, Lucius O'Brien borrows from various artistic movements. According to art historian François-Marc Gagnon,

> The painting, distinguished by the lower emotional key and enhanced by the enveloping atmosphere, navigates between the American aesthetics of the sublime espoused by the second generation of the Hudson School—with its powerful composition, the scale of Nature to Man and juxtaposition of sunrise with the dark mass of the Cape—the Romantic realism of the Luminists (such as Martin Johnson Heade and John Frederick Kensett)—with its poetic yet more interactive and personal character.¹⁷¹

O'Brien was familiar with the Hudson River School and understood its artists' use of the Sublime and their method of depicting emotion through expansive compositions and a subtle colour palette. O'Brien's work edges on the pastoral and the romantic, and follows some of the elements of Luminism.¹⁷² His use of simplified geometric composition and the image’s ethereal atmosphere and light create the tone of the work.¹⁷³ O'Brien's use of these various elements aid in the depiction of the beginning of a new and prosperous nation. Dennis Reid argues that the scene depicted in the painting attests to O'Brien's upper-class Victorian background and, consequently, his firm belief in Canada's position within the British Empire;¹⁷⁴ however, it is the borrowing of certain pictorial conventions from American art that allowed O'Brien to create a narrative of the new nation in this definitive work.

It has also been argued that O'Brien's style may have been influenced by the landscape paintings of American artist Albert Bierstadt (1930-1902).¹⁷⁵ This connection

---

¹⁷² Luminism, roughly, the painting of light and is applied specifically to the American landscape painters of the Hudson River school from about 1830–70. Often dominated by intense or dramatic lighting effects. Albert Bierstadt was famous for painting in this style. The Tate, Art Terms. https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/l/luminism
¹⁷⁴ Elizabeth Mulley, 74.
¹⁷⁵ Both Allan Pringle and Dennis Reid describe the possibility that Bierstadt influenced O'Brien work. Reid states that, “O'Brien was fully aware of Bierstadt's works of fifteen years earlier”. *Lucius R. O'Brien, Visions of Victorian Canada* (Toronto, Art Gallery of Ontario, 1990), 49.
is evident in the similarities between various technical aspects and compositions of both artists [Figure 2.12]. Bierstadt’s painting *Looking Down Yosemite Valley, California* (1865) shares striking parallels to O’Brien’s *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880); both artists employ similar compositional methods and poetic styles, and delicately render atmosphere and light in their scenes.\(^{176}\) Bierstadt was no stranger to Canada and was a frequent guest of Lord Dufferin and Lord Lorne at Rideau Hall in Ottawa.\(^{177}\) Bierstadt’s sweeping and dramatic landscapes were what Lorne and Dufferin had envisioned for the RCA. Both had a particular taste for a “certain view of landscape art,” which is perceivable in Bierstadt’s works.\(^{178}\) Whether or not O’Brien’s style was influenced by the older and more established American artist, *Sunrise on the Saguenay* seems to be an amalgamation of many of the artistic movements of the time. Nevertheless, the two artists would have occasion to work together in Quebec City. In the summer of 1879, Lord Dufferin invited O’Brien and the Bierstadt’s to join him at the Citadel.\(^{179}\) Ellen Ramsay states,

> It was in the context of his acquaintance with Dufferin (a distant relation of the O’Brien’s) that Lucius O’Brien came to be painting the Saguenay region in 1879, for it appears that O’Brien accompanied or at least visited the governor general on his vice-regal tour of the region. *Sunrise on the Saguenay* was one of several paintings that O’Brien produced during three summer trips to Quebec between 1878 and 1880.\(^{180}\)

However, there is some confusion as to when Bierstadt and O’Brien were both in Quebec City. Although both were indeed in the region on the vice-regal tour, Ramsay

\(^{177}\) After meeting Lord and Lady Dufferin at a dinner party in New York in the fall of 1874, the Bierstadt’s were frequent guests at Rideau Hall in Ottawa, and continued their friendships with Lord Lorne and Princess Louise until the mid 1880s. Allan Pringle, “Albert Bierstadt in Canada” *The American Art Journal*, Vol. 17, No. 1, (Winter 1985). 4.
\(^{178}\) Dennis Reid, 295.
\(^{179}\) Ellen Ramsay, “Picturing the Picturesque,” 163.
\(^{180}\) Ellen Ramsay, “Picturing the Picturesque,” 162-163.
argues that this event occurred during the summer of 1879.\textsuperscript{181} What can be substantiated is that both artists knew Lord Dufferin and Lord Lorne, and both did work together in Quebec City in 1879 and 1880. Whether or not O'Brien intentionally borrowed specific elements of Bierstadt's style is not known. There are notable commonalities between both artists, some of which can be seen in O'Brien's \textit{Sunrise on the Saguenay}.

William J. Topley also met Bierstadt\textsuperscript{182} through his connection with Lord Dufferin, who was then governor-general of Canada. Bierstadt met Lord Dufferin in New York in October of 1874 and shortly after was invited to Rideau Hall.\textsuperscript{183} In the fall of 1876, the vice-regent extended an invitation to the Bierstadts to attend the governor-general's fancy dress ball in February of 1876.\textsuperscript{184} As Dennis Reid writes, “It was an extravagant affair, one of the most elaborate parties ever to take place at the official residence, and the Bierstadts were flattered by the attention of Lord and Lady Dufferin, as well as delighted by the entertainment.”\textsuperscript{185} Photographs of the guests in costume were taken to commemorate the affair. As was standard at the time, a large composite photograph (an image pieced together from dozens of separate negatives) would be created to show who attended the event. Topley Studios was commissioned to create this composite.\textsuperscript{186}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{181} There are some discrepancies concerning when Bierstadt was in Quebec City. American scholar Allan Pringle states that Bierstadt was in Quebec City in September of 1880. It is known, however, that both Bierstadt and O'Brien worked together at the Citadel—possibly only a few steps apart.
\textsuperscript{182} It is important to mention that Albert Bierstadt was also quite adept with a camera and was part of his brothers, Charles and Edward’s, photography business. Bierstadt Bros. active from the 1850s until 1875. First out of New Bedford Massachusetts until the 1860, and then out of New York until 1875. New York Public Library http://pic.nypl.org/constituents/4831
\textsuperscript{184} Dennis Reid, ‘Our Own Country Canada’ 290.
\textsuperscript{185} Dennis Reid, 290.
\textsuperscript{186} Emma Hamilton-Hobbs, “Friendless Women to Fancy Dress Balls,” 15.
\end{flushleft}
As was the custom, Bierstadt [Figure 2.13] and his wife Rosalie [Figure 2.14] had their portraits taken, in costume, by Topley [Figure 2.15]. As a guest of honour, Bierstadt was given a place of prominence in the composite photograph. People of importance were portrayed larger and placed closer to the front of the composition than others of less social importance in the image.

**Advances in Photographic Technology**

When one thinks about the difficulties in taking photographs during the mid-1800s, what quickly comes to mind is a photographer laden with his photographic paraphernalia and required portable darkroom. Photography was not merely a point-and-shoot process; however, by the end of the century, the dry-plate method and the gelatin dry plates made life simpler for photographers like Topley. As noted earlier, plates were now pre-coated in the factory and could be stored for quite some time. This was particularly advantageous when it came to landscape photography. Instead of processing glass plates in the field, negatives could be taken back to the studio for processing. As well, Topley may have taken several cameras with him, each designed to create a different type of image, including stereoviews. Most photographers had preferences in equipment and often tested various models from different companies. In a testimonial written for *The Photographic Times*, Topley states that, although he liked to use the English box camera, he much preferred the lightness

---


189 According to the index, many of the negatives are 8x10 inches, a few were retaken as 5x7-inch shots, and a couple were taken in a 14x17-inch format.
of the American Optical Co.’s Venus box camera [Figure 2.16]. Interestingly, in the testimonial, Topley states, "You will be very glad to know that the Marquis of Lorne and Princess Louise have given us the privilege to say that our photographs of them are the best they ever had."\textsuperscript{190} This is high praise for the company. The lighter, more portable camera would allow the photographer to be able to take images with ease, unencumbered by heavy equipment and a traveling darkroom. This allowed the photographer be able to be more creative in the field. As such, this portability enabled Topley’s artistic aspirations while he was photographing the natural environment in the Saguenay region.

\textit{Paysages canadiens, Topley II: The Images of Cape Trinity (1878-1883)}

The images of Cape Trinity in \textit{Topley II} demonstrate Topley’s attention to various aesthetic principles used in visual art. Topley was motivated by commercial ends; however, he considered the subject matter and various aspects of the composition, similar to an artist in preparation for a canvas. These studies confirm that Topley emulated Lucius O’Brien’s \textit{Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity} (1880). A visual examination of the landscapes on pages 30 to 35 in \textit{Topley II} shows the use of fine art practices and a development towards a more thoughtfully composed form of photography [Figures 2.17, 2.18, & 2.19].\textsuperscript{191}

The similarities between O’Brien’s \textit{Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity} (1880) [Figure 2.11] and Topley’s images of Trinity Bay in \textit{Topley II} do not end with the titles


\textsuperscript{191} In the logbook from Topley Studios, the glass plate negatives are all numbered in sequence; the images were taken either on the same day or within a few days of each other.
and the location. As discussed, O’Brien had undertaken many sketching trips to the region, though the final product would be created in his studio. O’Brien made many modifications to the scene, and not all aspects of the portrayal of Cape Trinity are literal. The composition aids in the narrative produced and presents subtle messages about the new nation’s wealth and prosperity. In effect, the image is a translation of the majestic Canadian landscape into a nationalist framework. Elizabeth Mulley describes how such works are effective in presenting “the reality of the Canadian landscape and conveying a specific nationalistic message.” As the artist can make some adjustments to the composition that aid in the narrative, a photograph has an indexical relationship to the visible world. The composition has been thoughtfully and artistically composed, despite the limitations of the camera. Topley successfully created a more modernized photograph of Cape Trinity, based on the various cultural narratives of the time, and he was possibly influenced by O’Brien’s work. Despite their fundamental differences, the similarities between the works are unmistakable, and I argue that Topley was emulating Sunset on the Saguenay in his photographs of Cape Trinity.

The image titled Cape Trinity on the Saguenay River [Figure 2.1], which was introduced at the beginning of the chapter, is an example of Topley’s understanding of the narrative and compositional tropes of contemporary landscape painting. A canoe is just off centre in the composition, with two people fishing in the middle ground. The human presence and the canoe act as staffage to indicate the scale of the cliffs of Cape

---

Trinity and give the impression of the Sublime. The people in the canoe are not in any danger; however, the ruggedness of the surrounding environment displays its inaccessibility to the canoeists and to the viewers, indicating that nature can claim its omnipotence when it so chooses. As Gagnon argues,

Provided our own position is secure, their aspect is all the more attractive for its fearfulness; and we readily call these objects sublime, because they raise the forces of the soul above the height of the vulgar commonplace, and discover within us a power of resistance of quite another kind, which gives us courage to be able to measure ourselves against the seeming omnipotence of Nature.  

Topley has composed the shot by framing it to exclude the beach and darkening the cliff, making the bluff more imposing and, thus, creating an image that illustrates the tenuous relationship between man and nature. As well, the tops of the cliffs are not seen in the picture plane, giving the impression of endless height. Similarly, O'Brien has obscured the tops of the bluff, which gives the same impression of scale and endless height. Although Sunrise on the Saguenay is considered a picturesque work, it hints at the sublimity of nature in some respects. As Ellen Ramsay comments, "by securing the eye in this way, O'Brien is attempting to strike a balanced composition and to create a sense of the sublime scale of the bluffs in comparison with the small boats and the people of the bay; hence he offers the grandeur and sublimity of nature."  

Both works depict the sublimity and grandeur of nature by using the elements of landscape painting to evoke the same emotion.  

The Base of Trinity [Figure 2.17], on page 34 of the album, is similar in respect to the first image on page 30, which is not strictly a recreation of the environment. Here, the human presence is left out of the frame, and an emotional response is created with

196 Ellen Ramsay, “Picturing the Picturesque,” 166.
aesthetics. Topley is, in essence, trying to reproduce an emotional response similar to the experience on the paddle boats for the tourists. Part of the excursionist experience was for the boat to come close to the rock wall, allowing the passengers to feel the threat of crashing against the bluff. The blurring of the water gives the impression of movement, and the water’s juxtaposition with the sharp detail of the rock makes for a striking contrast; this proximity illustrates the hostility of the environment. The photographs on pages 30 and 34 both show a creative construction of the narrative by authoring the shot and incorporating what was physically there. Furthermore, the creative use of development techniques, with the darkening and sharpening of the rock formation by the photographer, allow the viewer to feel the same emotions as the tourists.

The series of three of the photographs in *Topley II* produces a sequence of views of Cape Trinity as if the observer was standing on the shoreline, watching the events unfold in the bay. The images in the album show the progression of the steamer through the shots while exhibiting an aesthetic development of the view of the capes. Pages 31 through 33 [Figure 2.18, 2.19, 2.20], which include *Saguenay River P.Q., Trinity* on page 32 and *Trinity* on page 33, illustrate the photographer’s ability to capture what is occurring in a given moment and to incorporate it in a meaningful way.¹⁹⁷ There are several clues in the images that indicate that Topley composed these images, such as the steamer included in the first two images (possibly filled with excursionists that would have frequented the area at the time). The first photograph on page 31 shows a canoe

---

¹⁹⁷ Album pages 31, 32 and 33 are all titled Trinity. However, LAC gives the image on Page 31 as Saguenay River, P.Q. for page 31 I will use LAC’s designation, the other two images will be differentiated by their page’s numbers: Trinity Page 32, and Trinity Page 33.
floating not far offshore while the paddle-wheel is in the distance below the cliffs. It would have been simple for Topley to obtain a schedule from one of the steamer companies, set up his camera on the shore and wait for the steamer to arrive. The canoeist, who creates more depth in the composition and adds to the narrative, was possibly an associate of Topley’s. Though it seems, at first glance, that the photographer is conventionally using the camera as a device to record the moment, the addition of the canoe and the steamer changes the image from a simple capturing of the location to one of a more thoughtful design.

Pages 32 and 33 [Figure 2.19, 2.20] are almost identical to page 31 but the canoeist has moved on or been removed. The steamer is present in the first image but, by the second, has continued upriver. The vessels in all of the images are minuscule and are overpowered by the cliffs. The removal of any indication of man by the last image on Page 33 changes the narrative from the juxtaposition of man and nature to the contemplation of the natural environment. In the third shot, Topley has physically stepped back and included more of the rocky beach. The indication is that, despite the rockiness of the land, it is accessible to the canoeist if safety is needed. The narrative is similar to that of *Sunrise on the Saguenay* in that the small vessels can access the shore, if needed, and in that they seem to be surrounded and protected by the cape’s bluffs. The dynamic composition, along with the arrangement of the photographs in the album, gives a panoramic view of the fjord. This sequence of images gives a sense of progression, culminating on page 33 [Figure 2.20]. Although the differences between the images are minute, they are meaningful. Throughout the last three views, the

---

198 Canoes seem to act as constant narrative and compositional elements, and they are included frequently in all three volumes of *Paysages canadiens* [Figure 2.20, 2.21, 2.22].
landscape has been the primary subject, while the human presence has played a minor role by creating a sense of scale. However, there is also another subtle narrative at play here—one where man has conquered the wilderness.

Many artists depicted the Canadian wilderness and its resources as a source of economic power and wealth. According to Marylin McKay, Confederation-era artists preferred to depict the landscape as a place to be explored, possibly exploited and settled. The landscape was also represented as an entity that was here for the development of those who wanted the challenge of the wilderness. Topley’s images of the Saguenay are reminiscent of O’Brien’s diploma work *Sunrise on the Saguenay*, *Cape Trinity* (1880), with their comparable narration of the bounty of the new nation. As McKay states, “Another reason so many artists preferred to depict the wilderness was that it was filled with natural resources, and therefore seen as a source of wealth for the new country”. While Topley was in the Saguenay, the area was in the midst of being logged for profit. Topley hints at this resource extraction by showing markings of development with the steamboat and the canoe. Skillfully, however, Topley has been able to omit any direct indication of the logging that was scarring the landscape in the region, thus indicating that—for these images at least—the environment was the prime consideration. These compositions should be viewed as Topley’s attempts at thoughtfully working out a narrative of his cultural and political moment, and it is important to note that the production of these pieces may have possibly been influenced by O’Brien’s work.

---

In Trinity Bay, Saguenay; and Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880)

The last relevant image in the discussion of Topley II is on page 35, titled In Trinity Bay, Saguenay [Figures 2.21 & 2.22]. Although no photograph could be an identical copy of O'Brien's painting, there are enough similarities to see some significant influences. The narrative of Topley's photograph speaks to the same optimistic narration of the new Dominion, albeit a more modern one than O'Brien's painting.

In conducting a visual comparison of two images, one has to consider the various elements that are similar between them. O'Brien's painting, as was discussed, is a mix of topographical accuracy and creative compositional and narrative elements; the piece was also created in the studio. In Topley's Trinity Bay, Saguenay photograph, deciphering the time of day with some accuracy would be complicated; however, Topley has given the viewer some indications that this is to be considered early morning. Within the painting, the promontory of Trinity physically faces northwest—not in the direction of the sunrise, to the east. This is where painter and photographer diverge from each other due to the relative indexical qualities of their disciplines. As John Berger claims, "Photographs do not translate from appearances. They quote from them." Topley has to work with the physical location and quote from it. Nevertheless, Topley has used various symbolic elements in much the same way that O'Brien did to indicate time. In both works, mistiness conveys mood, distance, and height by obscuring the tops of the bluffs—a phenomenon which typically occurs early in the morning. In each work, the

---

waters are calm and tranquil, indicating early morning. The environment is beyond Topley’s control, however, in being familiar with O’Brien’s work, he used what was there to aid in the creation of strikingly similar composition.

Another element where Topley diverges from *Sunrise on the Saguenay* is with his inclusion of human presence; such presence is indicated but is not foremost in O’Brien’s painting. In the photograph *In Trinity Bay*, a canoe includes two men, quite close to the beach. The person in the front is holding a firearm of some description, pointed inland, and a fishing pole is angled out over the water. The occupants of the boat seem to be out for a day of recreation that includes hunting and fishing. However subtle, the rifle and the fishing pole are both used symbolically by the photographer. Anglers such as Topley would have known that the optimal time to fish or hunt would be early in the morning, at sunrise. Fish feed on the surface during this period but move into deeper water during the heat of the day. Although hunting is not included in *Sunrise on the Saguenay*, Topley has incorporated this recreational aspect of the Saguenay region, which adds to his narrative.

The beach is used as a compositional element to direct the eye around both works. Both Topley and O’Brien used the beach to direct the eye. Ellen Ramsay suggests that the debris visible in O’Brien’s painting directs the viewer around the composition, leading back into the distance and beyond. Ramsay writes,

> In the place of the naturally arranged grass, rocks and bulrushes at the site, O’Brien has arranged a delicate mixture of deciduous foliage, rock and sandy beach. Structurally this studio artifice serves to attract the eye centrally within the composition and within the picture plane. . . .By securing the eye in this way, O’Brien is attempting to strike a balance in the composition and to create a sense

---

of the sublime scale of the bluffs in comparison with the small boats and the people in the bay; hence he offers the grandeur and sublimity of nature. Topley could not physically alter the landscape; nevertheless, he mediates the scene through framing, vantage point, and technological devices. Topley included the rocky beach in as close of proximity as possible in the composition, similar to *Sunrise on the Saguenay*. The promontory in both works takes over half of the picture plane and rocks and debris are used as compositional devices to direct the eye around the work. Topley would have had to find a similar location to depict the same point of view. The rocks in the photograph jut out into the water, directing the eye toward the canoe, then back to the sailboat and beyond to the magnificent bluffs of Cape Trinity. The bluffs are darker and more ominous than the previous images in *Topley II*; however, they imitate to some extent the cliffs in *Sunrise*. In these ways, the artists have used various compositional elements to show the insignificance of man in comparison to nature and the majesty of the fjord. In O'Brien's painting, the wilderness has been tamed somewhat, whereas the photographs illustrate the Sublime.

Similarly, the photograph shows that the wilderness can be civilized. Topley's addition of the man with the rifle suggests that humanity has some control over the wilderness through our ability to hunt, fish, and survive. Likewise, O'Brien has made use of various artistic adjustments to the landscape, which makes the work picturesque while also hinting at the past sublimity of the wilderness. O'Brien reaches into the past to capture a moment when the environment may have been seen for the first time by Europeans; this framing is indicated by the brigantine coming into the bay. Nevertheless, it brings the work into the present moment with the inclusion of the other

---

203 Ellen Ramsay, “Picturing the Picturesque,” 166.
vessels going about their daily business. In the photograph, the past is not part of the narrative; however, Topley has captured the present moment and shown an optimistic narrative about the wealth of the new nation. The photograph of *In Trinity Bay* also incorporates various elements of *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* to give a novel cultural narrative that speaks to the growth of a new nation. Despite the differences between the mediums, it is evident that both works are very similar. Topley has quoted and made use of symbolic elements that speak to *Sunrise*, which I argue shows the influence of Lucius O'Brien. In using what nature had already manifested and by thoughtfully working out the composition and the narrative, Topley was able to apply fine art practices in his images of Cape Trinity.

The Saguenay River was a favourite venue for artists, writers, tourists, and photographers. With its tourism and industrialization, it was also touted as representative of the growth of the new dominion. Both William J. Topley and Lucius O'Brien, through their specific disciplines, captured the beauty and ruggedness of the area while leaving out the industrial progress on the environment. *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880) by Lucius O'Brien was acclaimed as a magnificent landscape and an influential vision of the nation. With the inclusion of a photograph of O'Brien’s work in *Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings)* and through the study of the five aforementioned photographs in *Paysages canadiens II*, I have shown that William James Topley was more than just a portrait photographer and businessman. Topley was deeply involved in the arts and drew on the techniques and conventions of landscape painting, which aided him in his own vision of the photographic arts.
Conclusion

Until recently, scholarship on William James Topley has primarily centred on his portraiture, immigration photographs, and commercial business. My thesis diverges from these aspects of his long career and, instead, considers his largely ignored landscape photography. I posit that he aspired to be a photographic artist. This thesis expands current scholarship and makes links between Topley’s activities and his interest in many visual arts committees and institutions in Ottawa as well as through his personal associations with contemporary Canadian artists. With this in mind, I argue that the landscape images of the albums Paysages canadiens and the photographic reproductions of paintings in Album 29 (Ottawa and Paintings) reflect Topley’s artistic sensibility.

My thesis’s main contribution to current scholarship is in expanding the single commercial view in which Topley has been previously studied. Undoubtedly, he was first a prominent and successful commercial businessman in Ottawa; nevertheless, he was also engaged with the development of his photography as an art form. As discussed, Topley was influenced by his associations and relationships with various RCA members at a time when several key cultural institutions were forming in Canada. This influence can be seen in his landscape photographs of Cape Trinity in the Saguenay region of Quebec. I explore the cultural significance of the Saguenay region at the turn of the nineteenth century, and the fascination of artists and photographers in capturing it in visual representations. Through these historical and cultural intersections of arts and tourism, images in Topley II, one of the volumes of Paysages canadiens, reveal links to Lucius O’Brien’s Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880), a work
that Topley photographed and that is contained in *Album 29 (Ottawa and Paintings)*. Through the sequenced images of the same location and similar point of view, I discuss Topley's developmental process a photographic artist, early in his career.

The first chapter establishes my argument by analyzing the photographic reproductions by a few of the Royal Canadian Academy of Arts members, which are dispersed throughout *Ottawa & Paintings*. It is through these images that I provided the historical background for my larger argument. From here, I examine public perceptions of photography at the time when it was commonly viewed as a mechanical reproduction of what was in front of the camera lens. During Topley's lifetime, the public's perception of the photograph was changing from an uncreative mechanical recording to that of an artistic discipline. It was through the formation of the Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa, that I grasped that Topley had been developing his photography as art. I contend that these relationships may have influenced Topley's artistic aspirations and growth.

Chapter Two analyzes five images of *Trinity Bay* from *Topley II*, and illustrates the use of fine art elements in Topley's photographs. I compare these to RCA President Lucius O'Brien's diploma work *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880). Through these images, I explore the use of the tropes of fine art, which he used to compose his landscape photographs of the Saguenay. My final analysis culminates in exploring Topley's photograph *In Trinity Bay, Saguenay, P.Q.* which emulates O'Brien's celebrated work. Both the artist and the photographer had control over what is in the image and both show that the painting and the photograph can be a creative version of reality.
My research started by viewing many of W.J. Topley’s albums, as well as the plethora of images in the Topley Studio Fonds at Library and Archives Canada. I wanted to glean the historical significance of landscape photography in his oeuvre. What I found was a photographer whose work is more varied and complex than previous studied. My research methodology drew from art history, photo studies, historical research and literary narratives. I gathered material from secondary sources and archival materials as well as visual analysis. Through reading literary narratives, I gained an understanding of Victorian perspectives and the popularity of the Saguenay region. These narratives gave insights as to why Topley and many other artists depicted the area. In going through the articles Topley wrote for various publications, I found many clues as to his interests and concerns at the time.

Images digitized by Library and Archives Canada are a huge contribution to ongoing scholarship on William James Topley by making research materials readily accessible. There are approximately 150,000 glass-plate negatives held in the LAC Preservation Centre in Gatineau, Quebec, however, many of his landscape images have not been digitized. Examining just how many landscape images are included in the archives proved to be a daunting task. In addition to LAC, I speculate that there are many more landscape images hidden away in various archives across the country, which are outside of the fonds acquired in 1936. If incorporated, these images would add to a broader understanding of Topley’s landscapes, and his aspirations to be an artist and add cultural and photo historical value to the Topley Studio Fonds. However, in looking through the various images in his albums, Topley succinctly shows his
developmental progress in landscape photography. My thesis has only touched on the beginning of these aspects of his work.

Throughout my research, I have noticed a need for more literature and public interaction with William James Topley. Although the extensive web exhibition by former LAC archivist Andrew Rodger is an excellent resource, I think an updated version showing the diversity of Topley’s photography is needed. With my interest in cultural studies, as a photo historian I would like to entertain the possibility of both an onsite with in tandem with a virtual exhibition. This would include the landscape paintings from early exhibitions of the RCA. The exhibitions would give the viewers a breadth of knowledge and a historical timeline that would demonstrate what was occurring in the arts and photography in Canada post-Confederation. It would also exhibit Topley’s progression as a photographic landscape artist. Although I primarily focused on one painting by Lucius R. O’Brien in this thesis, my observations have enlightened me that during Topley’s early years as a photographer, emulated many of the other artists in Album 29, (Ottawa & Paintings). These comparisons could become the focus of more scholarly study and could be expanded to include various other landscape images from other albums and various archives from across the country. In addition to this, I believe there is a need for a largescale print publication illustrating the diversity in Topley’s work. This would include his portraiture, immigration photos, urban landmarks, the various infrastructure in Ottawa and other locations, and of course his landscape photography. I realize this would be a massive undertaking however it is brought to fruition. It is time that William James Topley’s landscape images step into public knowledge and scholarship as a photographic artist.
Illustrations

Figure Intro. 1
Photo: Trinity on the Saguenay, P.Q. (n.d.) glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm.
Source: Library and archives Canada/Topley Studio Fonds/MIKAN No. 3320860

Figure Intro. 2
Description: Paysages canadiens, Topley II, Album 83
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa/ Topley Studio Fonds/ Box # 01985
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure Intro. 3
Description: Topley Studio Album, Topley Album 29, *Ottawa & Paintings*
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 1.1
Description: Topley Studio Advertisement (n.d.) size unknown
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3406446
Figure 1.2
Description: The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa, first page of the Constitution and bylaws
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Topley Studio Fonds, Reference #R3411-0-2-E
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.3 (Left)
Description: The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa, first entry in the minute book (1898)
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Reference #R3411-0-2-E
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 1.4 (Right)
Description: The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa, signatures of the original members in the minute book of the club (1898)
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Reference #R3411-0-2-E
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.5
Photo: William James Topley, *Mount Robson and Berg Lake B.C.* (1914) b x w, nitrate negative, film, 12.5 x 15.5,
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3307643.
Credit: William James Topley

Figure 1.6
Description: The Photographic Arts Club of Ottawa, minute book, describing the role of honorary members (1898) (detail)
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Reference #R3411-0-2-E
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.7
Photo: William James Topley, *Laurier Avenue Bridge*, Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings), Page 4, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm (n.d.).
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN 138219
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 1.8
Photo: William James Topley, *Christ Church Cathedral*, Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings), Page 5, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm (n.d.)
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN 138219
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.9
Photo: William James Topley, Log Driving the Gatineau River P.Q., Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings), Page 9, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, (n.d.)
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN 138219
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 1.10
Description: Royal Canada Academy of Arts, First Exhibition Catalogue, March 6th, 1880. Page from the catalogue detailing the borrowed works from HRH Princess Louise.
Source: National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa, EX0002
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.11
Description: William James Topley, Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings) *The Hillside Gorge* (1889) by artist Homer Watson, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of the artwork.
Sources: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 1.12
Description: William James Topley, Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings) *Mother Love* (1889) by artist Paul Peel, Page 18, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of the artwork.
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.13
Description: William James Topley, Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings) *Mortgaging the Homestead* (1889) by artist G. A. Reid. Page 95, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photography reproduction of the artwork.
Sources: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 1.14
Description: William James Topley, Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings) *Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity* (1880) by artist Lucius R. O’Brien, Page 97, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of the artwork.
Photo: William James Topley
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.15


Date: Tenth Annual Exhibition, March 12, 1889, EX003

Source: National Gallery of Canada & Library and Archives Canada (PA 42348)

Credit: William James Topley

http://library.gallery.ca/search~S4~/XRoyal+Academy+of+Arts+1889&searchscope=4&SORT=DZ/VRoyal+Academy+of+Arts+1889&searchscope=4&SORT=DZ&extended=0&SUBKEY=Royal+Academy+of+Arts+1889/1%2C4%2C4%2CB/frameset&FF=XRoyal+Academy+of+Arts+1889&searchscope=4&SORT=DZ&4%2C4%2C
Figure 1.16
Description: William James Topley, *Princess Louise’s Studio at Rideau Hall*, Princess Louise Album, April, 1880, b x w, albumen print, positive silver paper, 183 x 235 mm,
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3210914 Credit: William James Topley

Figure 1.17
Description: William James Topley, *Princess Louise’s Boudoir*, Princess Louise Album, April, 1880, b x w, albumen print, positive silver paper, 183 x 235 mm,
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN No. 3210912 Credit: William James Topley
Figure 1.18

Description: Royal Canadian Academy of Arts, Exhibition Catalogue for Seventh Annual Exhibition (1886), illustrates that William James Topley is an honorary member of the Academy

Source: National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa, EX0002
http://library.gallery.ca/search~S4/?XRoyal+Academy+of+Arts+1886&searchscope=4&SORT=DZ/XRoyal+Academy+of+Arts+1886&searchscope=4&SORT=DZ&extended=0&SUBKEY=Royal+Academy+of+Arts+1886/1%2C4%2C4%2CB/frameset&FF=XRoyal+Academy+of+Arts+1886&searchscope=4&SORT=DZ&4%2C4%2C2C
Figure 1.19
Description: William James Topley, Portrait of *Peleg Franklin Brownell (1857-1946)*, Artist, 1912, 18 x 12.5 cm
Source: Library and Archives, Ottawa, Collection of the Camera Club of Ottawa Fonds, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN no: 3191886
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.20 (left)
Title: *The Photographer*
Artist: Peleg Franklin Brownell
Medium: Oil on canvas
Dimensions: 61.2 x 51.2
Date: 1896
Source: National Gallery of Canada
https://www.gallery.ca/salon-hanging/

Figure 1.21 (right)
Description: Self Portrait William James Topley, 18 x 12.5 cm, Collection of the Camera Club of Ottawa Fonds from the 1970 Retrospective of the CCOs History,
Photo: William James Topley
Source: Library and Archives Canada Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN 3425967
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.22

Description: William James Topley, Topley Album 29 (Ottawa & Paintings) Page 16, Lamplight (1893), by artist Peleg Franklin Brownell, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photographic reproduction of the artwork.

Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01972

Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 1.23
Artist: Peleg Franklin Brownell,
Title: Baptism on the Gatineau River P.Q. (1910)
Medium: Oil on canvas
Dimensions: 38.6 x 46.3
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Edwards Family Fonds, Topley Studio Fonds, a043064, MIKAN no. 3929133

Figure 2.1
Description: William James Topley, Cape Trinity on the Saguenay River, (ca. 1880)
Paysages canadiens, Topley II. Album 83, Page 30, Saguenay (Que), b & w Glass Plate Negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985
Figure 2.2
Description: William James Topley, *In Trinity Bay, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 5, b & w, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm. Saguenay (Que),
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985, MIAKN no. 330862
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 2.3
Description: William James Topley, *Untitled, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 3, b x w, alburnen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, photo of a fishing basket, reel and fish.
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 2.4
Description: William James Topley, *Sailing on the Saguenay, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 4, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm,
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 2.5
Description: William James Topley, *Cabin at Bardsville, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 1, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 2.6

Description: Topley Studios, Log book of glass-plate negatives, Topley Studios, Illustrates the glass plate negative numbers from Topley’s first trip to the Saguenay Region.

Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, FDA 0206

Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 2.7
Description: William James Topley, *Base of Cape Trinity, Tadousac and the Saguenay*, Album 159, Page 35, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm, Illustrates the use of the same image in various Topley Albums
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box # 01987
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 2.8
Description: William James Topley, *Tadousac and the Saguenay*, Album 159, Album cover, album covered in green leather and with gold lettering and trim.
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box # 01987
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 2.9
Description: William James Topley, *St. Marguerite*, Album 160, 40 x 30 cm, green leather cover with gold embossed lettering,
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01988
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 2.10
Description: William James Topley, *Lake Lorne*, P.Q. *Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 82, Page unknown, b x w, albumen print, 20.3 x 25.4 cm
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa ON, Topley Studio Fonds, Box #01985
Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 2.11  
**Title:** Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity (1880)  
**Artist:** Lucius R. O’Brien  
**Medium:** Oil on canvas  
**Dimensions:** 90 x 127 cm  
**Source:** National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa  
**Credit:** Christopher Davidson, with permission

Figure 2.12  
**Title:** Looking Down Yosemite Valley, California (1865)  
**Artist:** Albert Bierstadt  
**Dimensions:** 96 1/2” x 64”  
**Medium:** Oil on canvas  
**Source:** Birmingham Museum of Art  
Figure 2.13 (left)
Description: William James Topley, Mr. Bierstadt, Between February 24-26\textsuperscript{th} 1876 in Ottawa (Ont.), glass plate negative, b x w, 16.5 x 11.3 cm. On occasion of the Lord Dufferin's Fancy Dress Ball, Government House, Ottawa, Canada
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, e011091588, MIKAN No. 3477245
Credit: William James Topley

Figure 2.14 (right)
Description: William James Topley, Mrs. Bierstadt, between February 24-26\textsuperscript{th} 1876 in Ottawa (Ont.), glass plate negative, b x w, 16.5 x 11.3 cm, On occasion of the Lord Dufferin's Fancy Dress Ball, Government House, Ottawa, Canada
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, e011091590, MIKAN No. 3477247
Credit: William James Topley
Figure 2.15
Description: William James Topley, Lord Dufferin's Fancy Dress Ball, Government House, Ottawa, Canada, on February 23, 1876, Ottawa (Ont.) composite photograph, silver salts on silver, 83.4 x 34.7 cm (image)
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Robert H. Fooks Collection, e010900211
Credit: Topley Studios

Figure 2.16
Description: Box Camera, American Optical Venus Box Camera, 1879-1910,
Source: The California Museum of Photography, University of California.
Credit: http://piercevaubel.com/cam/am.opt.&scovill.alphabetical.htm
Figure 2.17
Description: William James Topley, *Base of Trinity, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Page 34, Album 83, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, a008786
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 2.18
Description: William James Topley, *Saguenay River, P Q.* (between 1878-1883) Saguenay River, (Que), *Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 31, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN no: 332086, Credit: Sharon Newton
Figure 2.19  
**Description:** William James Topley, Trinity, Saguenay River (Que), *Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Album 83, Page 32, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm,  
**Source:** Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, a008786  
**Credit:** Sharon Newton

Figure 2.20  
**Description:** William James Topley, *Trinity*, *Paysages canadiens*, Topley II, Saguenay River (Que), Page 33, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm  
**Source:** Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, a008786  
**Credit:** Sharon Newton
Figure 2.21
Description: William James Topley, *In Trinity Bay, Paysages canadiens*, Topley II Saguenay, Page 35, Album 83, albumen print, glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm.
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN no. 3244823
Credit: Sharon Newton

Figure 2.22
Description: William James Topley, *In Eternity Bay, Saguenay*, Image 65 of the Princess Louise Album, also in Paysages Canadian Topley II, Page 35, Album 83, Titled: *In Trinity Bay* Saguenay (Que) glass plate negative, 20.3 x 25.4 cm.
Source: Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Topley Studio Fonds, MIKAN no. 3244823
Credit: William James Topley
Bibliography


Gessell. Paul. “Ottawa’s forgotten artist: Once the darling of this city’s art world, Franklin Brownell’s paintings are now dismissed as dated”. The Ottawa Citizen. 1998.


Reid, Dennis.” Fraser, John Arthur”, *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, vol. 12, University of Toronto/Université Laval, 2003—, Accessed May 23,


---. “Sunrise on the Saguenay, Cape Trinity,” *Canadian Art* 29, no. 3 (2012): 113. https://search-proquest-


Woods, Nicholas Augustus. “The Lower St. Lawrence, or, Quebec to Halifax via Gaspé and Pictou: to which is appended Mr. Wood's description of the River Saguenay: also, legends of the St. Lawrence and all about fishing” 1862. Canadian Online. http://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.36631/55?r=0&s=1

Websites


Tate, Art Terms, Luminism, Pictorialism, Romanticism, Sublime https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms